

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE FOURTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE

First Session

WEDNESDAY, 4 NOVEMBER 2020

No. 13

1.00 pm

1

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (West Coast).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Transport.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (East Coast).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Transport.

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Mr EDWARD CHIA BING HUI (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr ERIC CHUA (Tanjong Pagar) Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr CHUA KHENG WEE LOUIS (Sengkang).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah), Deputy Speaker.

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Sustainability and the Environment.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health.

Ms GAN SIOW HUANG (Marymount), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Aljunied).

Mr DERRICK GOH (Nee Soon).

Ms HE TING RU (Sengkang).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (East Coast), Deputy Prime Minister, Coordinating Minister for Economic Policies and Minister for Finance.

Mr SHAWN HUANG WEI ZHONG (Jurong).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance, Second Minister for National Development and Leader of the House.

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Health and Government Whip.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.

Dr KOH POH KOON (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Kebun Baru).

Mr DESMOND LEE (West Coast), Minister for National Development and Minister-in-charge of Social Services Integration.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEONG MUN WAI (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Bukit Panjang).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Assoc Prof JAMUS JEROME LIM (Sengkang).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms MARIAM JAAFAR (Sembawang).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for Social and Family Development, Second Minister for Health and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Education and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHD FAHMI BIN ALIMAN (Marine Parade).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Ms NADIA AHMAD SAMDIN (Ang Mo Kio).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Ms NG LING LING (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Miss RACHEL ONG (West Coast).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Transport.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Aljunied).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Ms HAZEL POA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms POH LI SAN (Sembawang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied), Leader of the Opposition.

Ms RAEESAH KHAN (Sengkang).

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong), Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Health.

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Mr SHARAEL TAHA (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of National Development and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITOY YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms HANY SOH (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms SUN XUELING (Punggol West), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr ALVIN TAN (Tanjong Pagar), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms CARRIE TAN (Nee Soon).

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Hougang).

Mr DESMOND TAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment.

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast), Deputy Speaker.

Mr TAN KIAT HOW (East Coast), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Ministry of National Development.

Dr TAN SEE LENG (Marine Parade), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Pioneer).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Jalan Besar), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for Social Policies.

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Law.

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Dr WAN RIZAL (Jalan Besar).

Mr DON WEE (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Minister for Education and Second Minister for Finance.

Mr XIE YAO QUAN (Jurong).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms YEO WAN LING (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr YIP HON WENG (Yio Chu Kang).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Radin Mas).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr ZHULKARNAIN ABDUL RAHIM (Chua Chu Kang).

- 1 10 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 2 Suspension of Standing Orders – (Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That, notwithstanding the Standing Orders:
 - (a) the Minister for Home Affairs and Law may, in his statement on the Parti Liyani case, give Parliament a full account of the conduct of the police officers and prosecutors involved in that case, and clarifications may be sought and given on the account given by the Minister; and
 - (b) Members may refer to and discuss the account given by the Minister when the motion standing in the name of Ms Sylvia Lim is under consideration by Parliament."
- 3 Ministerial Statement – Review of the Case of *Parti Liyani v Public Prosecutor* [2020] SGHC 187 – (Minister for Law and Home Affairs).
- 4 Singapore's Justice System – (Ms Sylvia Lim) – Motion made, and Question proposed – "That this House affirms that fairness, access and independence are cornerstones of Singapore's justice system and calls on the Government to recognise and remedy its shortcomings in order to enhance justice for all, regardless of means or social status, including facilitating a review of the justice system."; Debate arising.
- 5 Exempted Business – (Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the business set down on the Order Paper for today be exempted at this day's sitting from the provisions of Standing Order No. 2."
- 6 Singapore's Justice System – (Ms Sylvia Lim) – Debate resumed on Question – "That this House affirms that fairness, access and independence are cornerstones of Singapore's justice system and calls on the Government to recognise and remedy its shortcomings in order to enhance justice for all, regardless of means or social status, including facilitating a review of the justice system."
- 7 Time Limit for Speeches – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mr Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) to remove the time limit in respect of Mr Murali Pillai's speech."
- 8 Singapore's Justice System – (Ms Sylvia Lim) – Debate resumed on Question – "That this House affirms that fairness, access and independence are cornerstones of Singapore's justice system and calls on the Government to recognise and remedy its shortcomings in order to enhance justice for all, regardless of means or social status, including facilitating a review of the justice system."

Amendments proposed:

- (1) In line 1, to delete "affirms" and insert "recognises";
- (2) In line 3, to delete "calls on the Government to recognise" and insert "affirms the Government's continuous efforts since Independence to build a fair and just society";
- (3) In line 3, to delete "its shortcomings" and insert "any shortcoming";
- (4) In line 4, after the words "regardless of" to insert the words "race, language, religion, economic"; and
- (5) In line 5, to delete ", including facilitating a review of the justice system" and insert a full-stop. – (Mr Murali Pillai).

Debate resumed on Question, "The Question is the amendments as moved by Mr Murali Pillai."

Question, "That amendment number (1) be made.", put, and agreed to.

Question, "That amendment number (2) be made.", put, and agreed to with the following Members dissenting:-

Mr Chua Kheng Wee Louis (Sengkang)
Mr Gerald Giam Yean Song (Aljunied)
Ms He Ting Ru (Sengkang)
Mr Leong Mun Wai (Non-Constituency Member)
Assoc Prof Jamus Jerome Lim (Sengkang)
Ms Sylvia Lim (Aljunied)
Mr Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
Mr Leon Perera (Aljunied)
Ms Hazel Poa (Non-Constituency Member)
Mr Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
Ms Raeesah Khan (Sengkang)
Mr Dennis Tan Lip Fong (Hougang)

Question, "That amendment number (3) be made.", put, and agreed to with the following Members dissenting:-

Mr Chua Kheng Wee Louis (Sengkang)
Mr Gerald Giam Yean Song (Aljunied)
Ms He Ting Ru (Sengkang)
Mr Leong Mun Wai (Non-Constituency Member)
Assoc Prof Jamus Jerome Lim (Sengkang)
Ms Sylvia Lim (Aljunied)
Mr Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
Mr Leon Perera (Aljunied)
Ms Hazel Poa (Non-Constituency Member)
Mr Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
Ms Raeesah Khan (Sengkang)
Mr Dennis Tan Lip Fong (Hougang)

Question, "That amendment number (4) be made.", put, and agreed to.

Question, "That amendment number (5) be made.", put, and agreed to with the following Members dissenting:-

Mr Chua Kheng Wee Louis (Sengkang)
Mr Gerald Giam Yean Song (Aljunied)
Ms He Ting Ru (Sengkang)
Mr Leong Mun Wai (Non-Constituency Member)
Assoc Prof Jamus Jerome Lim (Sengkang)
Ms Sylvia Lim (Aljunied)
Mr Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
Mr Leon Perera (Aljunied)
Ms Hazel Poa (Non-Constituency Member)
Mr Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
Ms Raeesah Khan (Sengkang)
Mr Dennis Tan Lip Fong (Hougang)

Original motion, as amended, put and agreed to with the following Members dissenting:-

Mr Chua Kheng Wee Louis (Sengkang)
Mr Gerald Giam Yean Song (Aljunied)
Ms He Ting Ru (Sengkang)
Mr Leong Mun Wai (Non-Constituency Member)
Assoc Prof Jamus Jerome Lim (Sengkang)
Ms Sylvia Lim (Aljunied)
Mr Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
Mr Leon Perera (Aljunied)
Ms Hazel Poa (Non-Constituency Member)
Mr Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
Ms Raeesah Khan (Sengkang)
Mr Dennis Tan Lip Fong (Hougang)

Resolved, "That this House recognises that fairness, access and independence are cornerstones of Singapore's justice system and affirms the Government's continuous efforts since Independence to build a fair and just society and remedy any shortcoming in order to enhance justice for all, regardless of race, language, religion, economic means or social status."

- 9 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to a date to be fixed."

Adjourned at 11.49 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,
Speaker

MEMORANDUM

Parliament stands adjourned to a date to be fixed.
