

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE
THIRTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

Second Session

FRIDAY, 1 MARCH 2019

No. 96

11.00 am

1

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Mr AMRIN AMIN (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Health.

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (Fengshan).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Trade and Industry and Government Whip.

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of Education.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Punggol East), Deputy Speaker.

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr ARASU DURAISAMY (Nominated Member).

Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Leader of the House.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Assoc Prof DANIEL GOH PEI SIONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Finance.

Mr TERENCE HO WEE SAN (Nominated Member).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance and Second Minister for Education.

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Communications and Information.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources and Ministry of Health.

Dr KOH POH KOON (Ang Mo Kio), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Nee Soon).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Transport.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for National Development and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten), Deputy Speaker.

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast).

Prof LIM SUN SUN (Nominated Member).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHAMED IRSHAD (Nominated Member).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Dr LILY NEO (Jalan Besar).

Mr NG CHEE MENG (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Ms ANTHEA ONG (Nominated Member).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Education.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong).

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms SUN XUE LING (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Social and Family Development and Deputy Government Whip.

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (West Coast).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang).

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for Economic and Social Policies.

Assoc Prof WALTER THESEIRA (Nominated Member).

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Health.

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Minister for National Development and Second Minister for Finance.

Prof YAACOB IBRAHIM (Jalan Besar).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr YEE CHIA HSING (Chua Chu Kang).

Ms YIP PIN XIU (Nominated Member).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development and Ministry of Manpower.

ABSENT:

Mr DOUGLAS FOO (Nominated Member).

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Coordinating Minister for Infrastructure and Minister for Transport.

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast).

Ms IRENE QUAY SIEW CHING (Nominated Member).

- 1 Paper presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
 - 1.1 Charities (Institutions of a Public Character) (Amendment) Regulations 2019 – Presented on 1 March 2019 (S. L. 600 of 2019).
- 2 3 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 Supplementary Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1 April 2018 to 31 March 2019 (Paper Cmd. 20 of 2019) – Committee of Supply (Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

(In the Committee)

Supplementary Main Estimates
of Expenditure for FY2018/2019

Head K – Ministry of Education –

Amendment proposed, “That the total sum to be allocated for Head K be reduced by \$100 in respect of Code 3000.”. – (Assoc Prof Walter Theseira).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$370,000,000 for Head K agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Main Estimates.

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Main Estimates.

<i>Head</i>	\$
E Judicature	1,092,300
G Presidential Councils	246,300
O Ministry of Health	150,000,000
P Ministry of Home Affairs	207,432,200
Q Ministry of Communications and Information	113,490,500
S Ministry of Manpower	66,013,300
T Ministry of National Development	293,593,900
V Ministry of Trade and Industry	31,673,700
W Ministry of Transport	92,733,400
X Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth	5,809,500

Resolved, "That the sum of \$1,332,085,100 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Main Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1 April 2018 to 31 March 2019, contained in Paper Cmd. 20 of 2019."

Resolution to be reported.

Supplementary Development Estimates
of Expenditure for FY2018/2019

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Development Estimates.

<i>Head</i>	\$
E Judicature	2,665,800
O Ministry of Health	250,000,000
S Ministry of Manpower	11,600,000
X Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth	30,646,700

Resolved, "That the sum of \$294,912,500 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Development Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1 April 2018 to 31 March 2019, contained in Paper Cmd. 20 of 2019."

Resolution to be reported.

Resolutions reported and agreed to.

- 4 Estimates for the financial year 1 April 2019 to 31 March 2020 (Paper Cmd. 19 of 2019) – Committee of Supply (2nd Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

(In the Committee)

Head J – Ministry of Defence –

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head J of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Vikram Nair).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$14,981,206,800 for Head J agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$761,800,000 for Head J agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head N – Ministry of Foreign Affairs –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head N of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Vikram Nair).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$474,995,400 for Head N agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$16,000,000 for Head N agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head P – Ministry of Home Affairs –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head P of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Christopher de Souza).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$5,777,979,300 for Head P agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$978,638,600 for Head P agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head R – Ministry of Law –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head R of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Christopher de Souza); Debate arising.

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker (Mr Charles Chong), Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported now and leave be asked to sit again on Monday, 4 March 2019." – (Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Law).

Progress reported – (Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Law).

Committee to sit again on Monday, 4 March 2019.

- 5 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn."

Adjourned at 6.48 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,
Speaker

MEMORANDUM

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 11.00 am on Monday, 4 March 2019.
