

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE
THIRTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

Second Session

WEDNESDAY, 8 MAY 2019

No. 105

10.30 am

1

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Mr AMRIN AMIN (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Health.

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (Fengshan).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Trade and Industry and Government Whip.

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of Education.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Punggol East), Deputy Speaker.

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr ARASU DURAISAMY (Nominated Member).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Assoc Prof DANIEL GOH PEI SIONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr TERENCE HO WEE SAN (Nominated Member).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance and Second Minister for Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Communications and Information.

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Coordinating Minister for Infrastructure and Minister for Transport.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources and Ministry of Health.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Nee Soon).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Transport.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for National Development and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten), Deputy Speaker.

Mr LIM HNG KLANG (West Coast).

Prof LIM SUN SUN (Nominated Member).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHAMED IRSHAD (Nominated Member).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Dr LILY NEO (Jalan Besar).

Mr NG CHEE MENG (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Ms ANTHEA ONG (Nominated Member).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Education.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Ms IRENE QUAY SIEW CHING (Nominated Member).

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong).

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms SUN XUELING (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (West Coast).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang).

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for Social Policies.

Assoc Prof WALTER THESEIRA (Nominated Member).

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Health.

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Minister for National Development and Second Minister for Finance.

Prof YAACOB IBRAHIM (Jalan Besar).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr YEE CHIA HSING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development and Ministry of Manpower.

ABSENT:

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr DOUGLAS FOO (Nominated Member).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Dr KOH POH KOON (Ang Mo Kio), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Social and Family Development and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms YIP PIN XIU (Nominated Member).

- 1 Paper presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
- 1.1 Road Traffic (Electronic Road Pricing System) (Amendment No. 2) Rules 2019 – Presented on 8 May 2019 (S. L. 645 of 2019).
- 2 12 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 Protection from Online Falsehoods and Manipulation Bill – (Minister for Law) – Question again proposed on the resumption of debate, "That the Bill be now read a second time."; Debate arising.
- 4 Exempted Business – (Deputy Government Whip (Ms Sim Ann), on behalf of the Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the business set down on the Order Paper for today be exempted at this day's sitting from the provisions of Standing Order No. 2.".
- 5 Protection from Online Falsehoods and Manipulation Bill – (Minister for Law) – Debate resumed on Question, "That the Bill be now read a second time.".

On Question put, – a division was taken: Ayes 74, Noes 9, Abstention 1.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>Noes</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Amrin Amin	Chen Show Mao	Lim Sun Sun
Ang Hin Kee	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel	
Ang Wei Neng	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap	
Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl	Lim, Sylvia	
Chan Chun Sing	Low Thia Khiang	
Chee Hong Tat	Perera, Leon	
Cheng Li Hui	Png Eng Huat	
Chia Shi-Lu	Pritam Singh	
Chong, Charles	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis	
Chong Kee Hiong		
Choo, Desmond		
Darryl David		
De Souza, Christopher		
Duraisamy, Arasu		
Foo Chee Keng, Cedric		
Gan Kim Yong		
Gan Thiam Poh		
Goh Chok Tong		
Heng Chee How		
Indranee Rajah		
Intan Azura Mokhtar		
Iswaran, S		
Janil Puthucheary		
Khaw Boon Wan		
Khor Lean Suan, Amy		
Kwek Hian Chuan, Henry		
Lam Pin Min		
Lee Bee Wah		

Ayes – continued

Lee Hsien Loong
Lim Biow Chuan
Lim Hng Kiang
Lim Swee Say
Lim Wee Kiak
Low Yen Ling
Masagos Zulkifli B M M
Mohamad Maliki Osman
Mohamed Irshad
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim
Murali Pillai
Neo, Lily
Ng Chee Meng
Ng Eng Hen
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis
Ong, Anthea
Ong Teng Koon
Ong Ye Kung
Pereira, Joan
Phua Lay Peng, Denise
Quay, Irene
Rahayu Mahzam
Saktiandi Supaat
Seah Kian Peng
Shanmugam, K
Sim Ann
Sitoh Yih Pin
Sun Xueling
Tan Wu Meng
Tay Teck Guan, Patrick
Teo Chee Hean
Teo, Josephine
Teo Ser Luck
Tharman Shanmugaratnam
Theseira, Walter
Tin Pei Ling
Tong Chun Fai, Edwin
Vikram Nair
Vivian Balakrishnan
Wong, Lawrence
Yaacob Ibrahim
Yam Ziming, Alex
Yee Chia Hsing
Yong Yik Chye, Melvin
Zainal Sapari
Zaqy Mohamad

Bill read a second time and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Minister for Law).

(In the Committee)

Clauses 1 to 12 inclusive agreed to.

Clause 13:

Amendment proposed, in page 20, lines 25 and 26 by leaving out “identify the subject statement in sufficient detail.”, and inserting –
“—

- (a) identify the subject statement in sufficient detail;
- (b) identify the true facts and their supporting evidence, and/or the evidence demonstrating the subject statement to be false, to the extent practicable;
- (c) specify the public interest objects of the Direction; and
- (d) provide the reasons why the Direction is commensurate with and shall satisfy the public interest objects so declared.”. – (Ms Anthea Ong).

Amendment negated.

Clause 13 agreed to with the following 3 Members dissenting and 9 Members abstaining:-

<i>Dissenting</i>	<i>Abstaining</i>
Ong, Anthea (Nominated Member)	Chen Show Mao (Aljunied)
Quay, Irene (Nominated Member)	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel (Non-Constituency Member)
Theseira, Walter (Nominated Member)	Lim, Sylvia (Aljunied)
	Low Thia Kiang (Aljunied)
	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
	Perera, Leon (Non-Constituency Member)
	Png Eng Huat (Hougang)
	Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis (Non-Constituency Member)

Clauses 14 to 16 inclusive agreed to.

Clause 17:

Amendment proposed, in page 23, after line 31, by inserting –

“(10) In giving effect to this provision, the Minister shall do everything reasonable to ensure that appeals to the Minister are adjudicated without delay, that upon appeal to the High Court hearings shall commence as soon as practicable, and that costs to the appellant are minimised.”.
– (Ms Anthea Ong).

Amendment negated.

Clause 17 agreed to with the following 3 Members dissenting and 9 Members abstaining:-

<i>Dissenting</i>	<i>Abstaining</i>
Ong, Anthea (Nominated Member)	Chen Show Mao (Aljunied)
Quay, Irene (Nominated Member)	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel (Non-Constituency Member)
Theseira, Walter (Nominated Member)	Lim, Sylvia (Aljunied)
	Low Thia Kiang (Aljunied)
	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
	Perera, Leon (Non-Constituency Member)
	Png Eng Huat (Hougang)
	Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis (Non-Constituency Member)

Clauses 18 to 24 inclusive agreed to.

Clause 25:

Amendment proposed, in page 30, lines 7 and 8 by leaving out “identify in sufficient detail the subject material and the subject statement.”, and inserting –
“—

- (a) identify the subject statement in sufficient detail;
- (b) identify the true facts and their supporting evidence, and/or the evidence demonstrating the subject statement to be false, to the extent practicable;
- (c) specify the public interest objects of the Direction; and
- (d) provide the reasons why the Direction is commensurate with and shall satisfy the public interest objects so declared.”. – (Ms Anthea Ong).

Amendment negated.

Clause 25 agreed to with the following 3 Members dissenting and 9 Members abstaining:-

<i>Dissenting</i>	<i>Abstaining</i>
Ong, Anthea (Nominated Member)	Chen Show Mao (Aljunied)
Quay, Irene (Nominated Member)	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel (Non-Constituency Member)
Theseira, Walter (Nominated Member)	Lim, Sylvia (Aljunied)
	Low Thia Khiang (Aljunied)
	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
	Perera, Leon (Non-Constituency Member)
	Png Eng Huat (Hougang)
	Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis (Non-Constituency Member)

Clauses 26 to 28 inclusive agreed to.

Clause 29:

Amendment proposed, in page 34, after line 9, by inserting –

“(11) In giving effect to this provision, the Minister shall do everything reasonable to ensure that appeals to the Minister are adjudicated without delay, that upon appeal to the High Court hearings shall commence as soon as practicable, and that costs to the appellant are minimised.”.
– (Ms Anthea Ong).

Amendment negated.

Clause 29 agreed to with the following 3 Members dissenting and 9 Members abstaining:-

<i>Dissenting</i>	<i>Abstaining</i>
Ong, Anthea (Nominated Member)	Chen Show Mao (Aljunied)
Quay, Irene (Nominated Member)	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel (Non-Constituency Member)
Theseira, Walter (Nominated Member)	Lim, Sylvia (Aljunied)
	Low Thia Khiang (Aljunied)
	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
	Perera, Leon (Non-Constituency Member)
	Png Eng Huat (Hougang)
	Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis (Non-Constituency Member)

Clauses 30 to 34 inclusive agreed to.

Clause 35:

Amendment proposed, in page 41, after line 22, by inserting –

“(9) In giving effect to this provision, the Minister shall do everything reasonable to ensure that appeals to the Minister are adjudicated without delay, that upon appeal to the High Court hearings shall commence as soon as practicable, and that costs to the appellant are minimised.”.
– (Ms Anthea Ong).

Amendment negatived.

Clause 35 agreed to with the following 3 Members dissenting and 9 Members abstaining:-

<i>Dissenting</i>	<i>Abstaining</i>
Ong, Anthea (Nominated Member)	Chen Show Mao (Aljunied)
Quay, Irene (Nominated Member)	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel (Non-Constituency Member)
Theseira, Walter (Nominated Member)	Lim, Sylvia (Aljunied)
	Low Thia Kiang (Aljunied)
	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
	Perera, Leon (Non-Constituency Member)
	Png Eng Huat (Hougang)
	Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis (Non-Constituency Member)

Clauses 36 to 43 inclusive agreed to.

Clause 44:

Amendment proposed, in page 51, after line 12, by inserting –

“(11) In giving effect to this provision, the Minister shall do everything reasonable to ensure that appeals to the Minister are adjudicated without delay, that upon appeal to the High Court hearings shall commence as soon as practicable, and that costs to the appellant are minimised.”.
– (Ms Anthea Ong).

Amendment negatived.

Clause 44 agreed to with the following 3 Members dissenting and 9 Members abstaining:-

<i>Dissenting</i>	<i>Abstaining</i>
Ong, Anthea (Nominated Member)	Chen Show Mao (Aljunied)
Quay, Irene (Nominated Member)	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel (Non-Constituency Member)
Theseira, Walter (Nominated Member)	Lim, Sylvia (Aljunied)
	Low Thia Kiang (Aljunied)
	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
	Perera, Leon (Non-Constituency Member)
	Png Eng Huat (Hougang)
	Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis (Non-Constituency Member)

Clauses 45 to 62 inclusive agreed to.

New Clause (A):

In page 12, after line 14, by inserting –

“Principles of Act

- A. In performing any duty or exercising any power under this Act in relation to the communication of online Falsehoods, any Minister and any Competent Authority must have regard to the following principles of this Act:
- (a) the ability of a well-informed public to critically evaluate, establish, debate and question facts, opinions, and ideas is integral to a well-functioning democracy;
 - (b) as facts can be contentious and difficult to establish, and because the advancement of knowledge often depends on contesting apparent facts, the disputation of a fact does not imply that one or more contested facts are falsehoods by that virtue alone;
 - (c) while an authority may have higher quality data or more accurate means of determining the facts, given the variety of legitimate means by which facts can be established, a statement of fact that differs from a fact established by an authority does not imply a falsehood by that virtue alone;
 - (d) non-legislative measures are the least restrictive way of addressing online Falsehoods and should be preferred to the exercise of executive powers when feasible;
 - (e) the executive powers in this Act may be regarded as, from least to most restrictive: A Correction Direction, a Targeted Correction Direction, a General Correction Direction, a Stop Communication Direction, and a Disabling Direction;
 - (f) regard must be had to whether the public interest for which the duty is being performed or the power is being exercised can be achieved in the way that is the least restrictive on the rights of the public to speak and debate freely;
 - (g) in all matters relating to the administration or application of this Act, the aim is to target material online falsehoods that are against the public interest, and not opinions, comments, critiques, satire, parody, generalisations or statements of experiences.”.
- (Assoc Prof Walter Theseira).

New Clause (A) negatived with the following 3 Members dissenting and 9 Members abstaining:-

Dissenting

Ong, Anthea (Nominated Member)
Quay, Irene (Nominated Member)
Theseira, Walter (Nominated Member)

Abstaining

Chen Show Mao (Aljunied)
Goh Pei Siong, Daniel (Non-Constituency Member)
Lim, Sylvia (Aljunied)
Low Thia Kiang (Aljunied)
Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
Perera, Leon (Non-Constituency Member)
Png Eng Huat (Hougang)
Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
Tan Lip Fong, Dennis (Non-Constituency Member)

New Clause (B):

In page 67, after line 19, by inserting –

“PART 10

INDEPENDENT COUNCIL TO STRENGTHEN SOCIETY AGAINST ONLINE
FALSEHOODS

B. – (1) There is hereby established a council to be called the Independent Council Against Online Falsehoods which shall consist of

- (a) a Chairman; and
- (b) such other members as the appointing authority may determine;
- (c) where the appointing authority shall be a Select Committee of Parliament.

(2) The Constitution and Proceedings of the Council shall be determined by Schedule, provided that –

- (a) where the appointment and tenure of office of members is concerned:
 - (i) no member shall hold an office of profit under the Government;
 - (ii) no member shall be a Member of Parliament or stand as a candidate for election as a Member of Parliament;
 - (iii) no appointment of any member shall be revoked without valid cause, where such valid causes shall be limited to inability to perform the functions of the Council, dereliction of duties relating to the Council, or acts that prejudice the independent functioning of the Council;
 - (iv) the tenure of office of all members shall be at least two years on appointment and shall be automatically extended, in the case of a general election which occurs during the tenure of office of any member, to include a term of at least one year past the date of that general election.
- (b) nothing shall be specified or required that prejudices the independent functioning of the Council.

(3) The functions of the Council are –

- (a) to evaluate the state and effects of online falsehoods communicated in Singapore, including online falsehoods not subject to Directions;
- (b) to evaluate Directions issued with respect to the type of online falsehoods addressed and the public interest causes of action, effects of Directions, appeals processes, and other matters as determined by the Council, provided that –
 - (i) no Direction shall be reviewed which is sub judice or subject to an ongoing appeal at the point of review;
 - (ii) Directions shall not be the subject of individual review except where at the discretion of the Council public confidence in the exercise of powers under the Act requires it;
 - (iii) no review of any Direction shall be admissible as evidence of any wrongdoing or liability on the part of Government.
- (c) to evaluate other measures taken by Government under this Act to address online falsehoods;
- (d) to make recommendations to the Government on the general exercise of powers under the Act in order to strengthen efficacy and public confidence;
- (e) to liaise with the media, technology firms, and other experts to advise on public education, ground-up initiatives, and other measures to strengthen the capacity of Singaporeans to evaluate online information and resist falsehoods;

- (f) to liaise with scientific, specialist, and technical experts to advise the Government on examining contested facts of a specialist nature;
- (g) to undertake surveys or other arrangements to obtain public feedback on any matter relating to the functions of the Council; and
- (h) to perform such functions as the Minister may, by order published in the Gazette, assign, provided such functions do not compromise the independence of the Panel.

(4) The Council shall be furnished with the resources to discharge its functions under this Act, and in particular, shall –

- (a) have a Secretariat appointed by the Minister subject to the concurrence of the Chairman;
- (b) be entitled to request information on the exercise of powers under this Act from any relevant Ministry, who shall be under a duty to provide that information;
- (c) have funds provided to meet any expenses incurred in carrying out its functions, provided that the funds provided during any term of Government shall not be diminished during that term except with the agreement of the Chairman.

(5) The Council shall publish for public viewing in connection with its functions –

- (a) an annual report (or more frequently as the case may be) on the activities, findings, and recommendations of the Council; and
- (b) a report of any substantive proceedings of the Council; provided that
- (c) the content of any report may be minimally redacted if at the discretion of the Council it may weaken efficacy of measures to address online falsehoods, appear to render judgment on any particular Direction, expose market-sensitive information, or expose information subject to the Official Secrets Act.

(6) No suit or other legal proceedings shall lie personally against any Council member or other person acting under the direction of the Council for anything which is in good faith done or intended to be done in the execution or purported execution of this Act”. – (Ms Anthea Ong).

New Clause (B) negatived with the following 3 Members dissenting and 9 Members abstaining:-

<i>Dissenting</i>	<i>Abstaining</i>
Ong, Anthea (Nominated Member)	Chen Show Mao (Aljunied)
Quay, Irene (Nominated Member)	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel (Non-Constituency Member)
Theseira, Walter (Nominated Member)	Lim, Sylvia (Aljunied)
	Low Thia Khiang (Aljunied)
	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
	Perera, Leon (Non-Constituency Member)
	Png Eng Huat (Hougang)
	Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis (Non-Constituency Member)

The Schedule agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment.

Motion made and Question proposed, "That the Bill be now read a third time." – (Minister for Law).

On Question put, – a division was taken: Ayes 72, Noes 9, Abstentions 3.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>Noes</i>	<i>Abstentions</i>
Amrin Amin	Chen Show Mao	Ong, Anthea
Ang Hin Kee	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel	Quay, Irene
Ang Wei Neng	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap	Theseira, Walter
Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl	Lim, Sylvia	
Chan Chun Sing	Low Thia Khiang	
Chee Hong Tat	Perera, Leon	
Cheng Li Hui	Png Eng Huat	
Chia Shi-Lu	Pritam Singh	
Chong, Charles	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis	
Chong Kee Hiong		
Choo, Desmond		
Darryl David		
De Souza, Christopher		
Duraisamy, Arasu		
Foo Chee Keng, Cedric		
Gan Kim Yong		
Gan Thiam Poh		
Goh Chok Tong		
Heng Chee How		
Indranee Rajah		
Intan Azura Mokhtar		
Iswaran, S		
Janil Puthucheary		
Khaw Boon Wan		
Khor Lean Suan, Amy		
Kwek Hian Chuan, Henry		
Lam Pin Min		
Lee Bee Wah		
Lee Hsien Loong		
Lim Biow Chuan		
Lim Hng Kiang		
Lim Sun Sun		
Lim Swee Say		
Lim Wee Kiak		
Low Yen Ling		
Masagos Zulkifli B M M		
Mohamad Maliki Osman		
Mohamed Irshad		
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim		
Murali Pillai		
Neo, Lily		
Ng Chee Meng		
Ng Eng Hen		
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis		
Ong Teng Koon		
Ong Ye Kung		
Pereira, Joan		
Phua Lay Peng, Denise		
Rahayu Mahzam		
Saktiandi Supaat		

Ayes – continued

Seah Kian Peng
Shanmugam, K
Sim Ann
Sitoh Yih Pin
Sun Xueling
Tan Wu Meng
Tay Teck Guan, Patrick
Teo Chee Hean
Teo, Josephine
Teo Ser Luck
Tharman Shanmugaratnam
Tin Pei Ling
Tong Chun Fai, Edwin
Vikram Nair
Vivian Balakrishnan
Wong, Lawrence
Yaacob Ibrahim
Yam Ziming, Alex
Yee Chia Hsing
Yong Yik Chye, Melvin
Zainal Sapari
Zaqy Mohamad

Bill read a third time.

- 6 Adjournment – (Deputy Government Whip (Ms Sim Ann), on behalf of the Leader of the House)
– Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to a date to be fixed."

Adjourned at 10.19 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,
Speaker

MEMORANDUM

Parliament stands adjourned to a date to be fixed.
