

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE
FOURTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

First Session

TUESDAY, 7 FEBRUARY 2023

No. 82

1.30 pm

1

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Mr ABDUL SAMAD (Nominated Member).

Ms JANET ANG (Nominated Member).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (West Coast).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Education.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (East Coast).

Mr MARK CHAY (Nominated Member).

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr CHENG HSING YAO (Nominated Member).

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Mr EDWARD CHIA BING HUI (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr ERIC CHUA (Tanjong Pagar) Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr CHUA KHENG WEE LOUIS (Sengkang).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah), Deputy Speaker.

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Sustainability and the Environment.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Ms GAN SIOW HUANG (Marymount), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Aljunied).

Mr DERRICK GOH (Nee Soon).

Ms HE TING RU (Sengkang).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (East Coast), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for Economic Policies.

Prof HOON HIAN TECK (Nominated Member).

Mr SHAWN HUANG WEI ZHONG (Jurong).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance, Second Minister for National Development and Leader of the House.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Health and Government Whip.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.

Dr KOH POH KOON (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Manpower and Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Kebun Baru).

Mr DESMOND LEE (West Coast), Minister for National Development and Minister-in-charge of Social Services Integration.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEONG MUN WAI (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Bukit Panjang).

Mr LIM BIEW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Assoc Prof JAMUS JEROME LIM (Sengkang).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms MARIAM JAAFAR (Sembawang).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for Social and Family Development, Second Minister for Health and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Education and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHD FAHMI BIN ALIMAN (Marine Parade).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Ms NADIA AHMAD SAMDIN (Ang Mo Kio).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Ms NG LING LING (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Miss RACHEL ONG (West Coast).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Health.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Aljunied).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Ms HAZEL POA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms POH LI SAN (Sembawang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied), Leader of the Opposition.

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Law.

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Dr SHAHIRA ABDULLAH (Nominated Member).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Mr SHARAEL TAHA (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of National Development and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms HANY SOH (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms SUN XUELING (Punggol West), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr ALVIN TAN (Tanjong Pagar), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms CARRIE TAN (Nee Soon).

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Hougang).

Mr DESMOND TAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast), Deputy Speaker.

Mr TAN KIAT HOW (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of National Development.

Dr TAN SEE LENG (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Pioneer).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Jalan Besar), Minister for Communications and Information and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Mr RAJ JOSHUA THOMAS (Nominated Member).

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Dr WAN RIZAL (Jalan Besar).

Mr DON WEE (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Mr XIE YAO QUAN (Jurong).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms YEO WAN LING (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr YIP HON WENG (Yio Chu Kang).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Radin Mas).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr ZHULKARNAIN ABDUL RAHIM (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Transport and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Prof KOH LIAN PIN (Nominated Member).

Dr TAN YIA SWAM (Nominated Member).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for Social Policies.

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Law.

-
- 1 20 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 2 Affordable and Accessible Public Housing – (Minister for National Development) – Question again proposed on the resumption of debate, "That this House affirms the importance of keeping public housing affordable and accessible while protecting the interests of current and future generations of Singaporeans, and endorses the commitment of the Government to these twin goals."
- Public Housing Policies – (Mr Leong Mun Wai) – Question again proposed on the resumption of debate, "That this House calls upon the Government to review its public housing policies in order to deliver affordable and accessible HDB flats to all Singaporeans, strengthen the owner-occupation intent of public housing, protect retirement adequacy and keep public housing inclusive for every Singaporean of each generation."
- 3 Exempted Business – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the business set down on the Order Paper for today be exempted at this day's sitting from the provisions of Standing Order No. 2."
- 4 Affordable and Accessible Public Housing – (Minister for National Development) – Debate resumed on Question, "That this House affirms the importance of keeping public housing affordable and accessible while protecting the interests of current and future generations of Singaporeans, and endorses the commitment of the Government to these twin goals."
- Public Housing Policies – (Mr Leong Mun Wai) – Debate resumed on Question, "That this House calls upon the Government to review its public housing policies in order to deliver affordable and accessible HDB flats to all Singaporeans, strengthen the owner-occupation intent of public housing, protect retirement adequacy and keep public housing inclusive for every Singaporean of each generation."
- Amendments proposed to the motion on Affordable and Accessible Public Housing:
- In line 4, by deleting the words "endorses the commitment of the Government to" and inserting "calls on the Government to intensify its efforts to meet". – (Mr Pritam Singh)
- Question proposed, "That the words proposed to be left out, be there left out."; Debate arising.
- 5 Time Limit for Speeches – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mr Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) to remove the time limit in respect of Minister Desmond Lee's speech."
- 6 Affordable and Accessible Public Housing – (Minister for National Development) – Debate resumed on Question, "That this House affirms the importance of keeping public housing affordable and accessible while protecting the interests of current and future generations of Singaporeans, and endorses the commitment of the Government to these twin goals."
- Public Housing Policies – (Mr Leong Mun Wai) – Debate resumed on Question, "That this House calls upon the Government to review its public housing policies in order to deliver affordable and accessible HDB flats to all Singaporeans, strengthen the owner-occupation intent of public housing, protect retirement adequacy and keep public housing inclusive for every Singaporean of each generation."
- Amendments proposed to the motion on Affordable and Accessible Public Housing:
- In line 4, by deleting the words "endorses the commitment of the Government to" and inserting "calls on the Government to intensify its efforts to meet". – (Mr Pritam Singh)
- Debate resumed on Question, "That the words proposed to be left out, be there left out."
- On amendment, Question, "That the words proposed to be left out, be there left out.", put and negated.

7 Affordable and Accessible Public Housing – (Minister for National Development) – Question on original motion, put – a division was taken: Ayes 82, Noes 11, Abstention Nil.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>Noes</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Abdul Samad	Chua Kheng Wee, Louis	Nil
Ang, Janet	Giam Yean Song, Gerald	
Ang Wei Neng	He Ting Ru	
Baey Yam Keng	Leong Mun Wai	
Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl	Lim, Jamus Jerome	
Chay, Mark	Lim, Sylvia	
Chee Hong Tat	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap	
Cheng Hsing Yao	Perera, Leon	
Cheng Li Hui	Poa, Hazel	
Chia Bing Hui, Edward	Pritam Singh	
Chong Kee Hiong	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis	
Choo, Desmond		
Chua, Eric		
De Souza, Christopher		
Foo Mee Har		
Fu Hai Yien, Grace		
Gan Kim Yong		
Gan Siow Huang		
Gan Thiam Poh		
Goh, Derrick		
Heng Chee How		
Heng Swee Keat		
Hoon Hian Teck		
Huang Wei Zhong, Shawn		
Indrancee Rajah		
Khor Lean Suan, Amy		
Koh Poh Koon		
Kwek Hian Chuan, Henry		
Lee, Desmond		
Lee Hsien Loong		
Liang Eng Hwa		
Lim Biow Chuan		
Lim Wee Kiak		
Low Yen Ling		
Mariam Jaafar		
Masagos Zulkifli B M M		
Mohamad Maliki Bin Osman		
Mohd Fahmi Bin Aliman		
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim		
Murali Pillai		
Nadia Ahmad Samdin		
Ng Eng Hen		
Ng Ling Ling		
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis		
Ong, Rachel		
Ong Ye Kung		
Pereira, Joan		
Phua Lay Peng, Denise		
Poh Li San		
Rahayu Mahzam		
Raj Joshua Thomas		
Saktiandi Supaat		
Seah Kian Peng		
Sharael Taha		
Sim Ann		
Sitoh Yih Pin		
Soh, Hany		

Ayes - continued

Sun Xueling
 Tan, Alvin
 Tan, Carrie
 Tan Chuan-Jin
 Desmond Tan
 Tan Soon Neo, Jessica
 Tan Kiat How
 Tan See Leng
 Tan Wu Meng
 Tay Teck Guan, Patrick
 Teo Chee Hean
 Teo, Josephine
 Tin Pei Ling
 Vikram Nair
 Vivian Balakrishnan
 Wan Rizal
 Wee, Don
 Wong, Lawrence
 Xie Yao Quan
 Yam Ziming, Alex
 Yeo Wan Ling
 Yip Hon Weng
 Yong Yik Chye, Melvin
 Zaqy Mohamad
 Zhulkarnain Abdul Rahim

Resolved, "That this House affirms the importance of keeping public housing affordable and accessible while protecting the interests of current and future generations of Singaporeans, and endorses the commitment of the Government to these twin goals."

- 8 Public Housing Policies – (Mr Leong Mun Wai) – On Question put – a division was taken: Ayes 11, Noes 82, Abstention Nil.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>Noes</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Chua Kheng Wee, Louis	Abdul Samad	Nil
Giam Yean Song, Gerald	Ang, Janet	
He Ting Ru	Ang Wei Neng	
Leong Mun Wai	Baey Yam Keng	
Lim, Jamus Jerome	Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl	
Lim, Sylvia	Chay, Mark	
Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap	Chee Hong Tat	
Perera, Leon	Cheng Hsing Yao	
Poa, Hazel	Cheng Li Hui	
Pritam Singh	Chia Bing Hui, Edward	
Tan Lip Fong, Dennis	Chong Kee Hiong	
	Choo, Desmond	
	Chua, Eric	
	De Souza, Christopher	
	Foo Mee Har	
	Fu Hai Yien, Grace	
	Gan Kim Yong	
	Gan Siow Huang	
	Gan Thiam Poh	
	Goh, Derrick	
	Heng Chee How	
	Heng Swee Keat	
	Hoon Hian Teck	
	Huang Wei Zhong, Shawn	
	Indrance Rajah	

Noes – continued

Khor Lean Suan, Amy
Koh Poh Koon
Kwek Hian Chuan, Henry
Lee, Desmond
Lee Hsien Loong
Liang Eng Hwa
Lim Biow Chuan
Lim Wee Kiak
Low Yen Ling
Mariam Jaafar
Masagos Zulkifli B M M
Mohamad Maliki Bin Osman
Mohd Fahmi Bin Aliman
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim
Murali Pillai
Nadia Ahmad Samdin
Ng Eng Hen
Ng Ling Ling
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis
Ong, Rachel
Ong Ye Kung
Pereira, Joan
Phua Lay Peng, Denise
Poh Li San
Rahayu Mahzam
Raj Joshua Thomas
Saktiandi Supaat
Seah Kian Peng
Sharael Taha
Sim Ann
Sitoh Yih Pin
Soh, Hany
Sun Xueling
Tan, Alvin
Tan, Carrie
Tan Chuan-Jin
Desmond Tan
Tan Soon Neo, Jessica
Tan Kiat How
Tan See Leng
Tan Wu Meng
Tay Teck Guan, Patrick
Teo Chee Hean
Teo, Josephine
Tin Pei Ling
Vikram Nair
Vivian Balakrishnan
Wan Rizal
Wee, Don
Wong, Lawrence
Xie Yao Quan
Yam Ziming, Alex
Yeo Wan Ling
Yip Hon Weng
Yong Yik Chye, Melvin
Zaqy Mohamad
Zhulkarnain Abdul Rahim

Motion accordingly negatived.

9 Adjournment – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to a date to be fixed."

Adjourned at 11.08 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,
Speaker

MEMORANDUM

Parliament stands adjourned to a date to be fixed.
