

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE
FOURTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

First Session

MONDAY, 6 FEBRUARY 2023

No. 81

12 noon

1

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Mr ABDUL SAMAD (Nominated Member).

Ms JANET ANG (Nominated Member).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (West Coast).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Education.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (East Coast).

Mr MARK CHAY (Nominated Member).

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr CHENG HSING YAO (Nominated Member).

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Mr EDWARD CHIA BING HUI (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr ERIC CHUA (Tanjong Pagar) Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr CHUA KHENG WEE LOUIS (Sengkang).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah), Deputy Speaker.

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Sustainability and the Environment.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Ms GAN SIOW HUANG (Marymount), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Aljunied).

Mr DERRICK GOH (Nee Soon).

Ms HE TING RU (Sengkang).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (East Coast), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for Economic Policies.

Prof HOON HIAN TECK (Nominated Member).

Mr SHAWN HUANG WEI ZHONG (Jurong).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance, Second Minister for National Development and Leader of the House.

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Transport and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Health and Government Whip.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.

Prof KOH LIAN PIN (Nominated Member).

Dr KOH POH KOON (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Manpower and Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Kebun Baru).

Mr DESMOND LEE (West Coast), Minister for National Development and Minister-in-charge of Social Services Integration.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEONG MUN WAI (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Bukit Panjang).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Assoc Prof JAMUS JEROME LIM (Sengkang).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms MARIAM JAAFAR (Sembawang).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for Social and Family Development, Second Minister for Health and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Education and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHD FAHMI BIN ALIMAN (Marine Parade).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Ms NADIA AHMAD SAMDIN (Ang Mo Kio).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Ms NG LING LING (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Miss RACHEL ONG (West Coast).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Health.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Aljunied).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Ms HAZEL POA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms POH LI SAN (Sembawang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied), Leader of the Opposition.

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Law.

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Dr SHAHIRA ABDULLAH (Nominated Member).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Mr SHARAEL TAHA (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of National Development and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms HANY SOH (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms SUN XUELING (Punggol West), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr ALVIN TAN (Tanjong Pagar), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms CARRIE TAN (Nee Soon).

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Hougang).

Mr DESMOND TAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast), Deputy Speaker.

Mr TAN KIAT HOW (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of National Development.

Dr TAN SEE LENG (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Pioneer).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Jalan Besar), Minister for Communications and Information and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Dr WAN RIZAL (Jalan Besar).

Mr DON WEE (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Mr XIE YAO QUAN (Jurong).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms YEO WAN LING (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr YIP HON WENG (Yio Chu Kang).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Radin Mas).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr ZHULKARNAIN ABDUL RAHIM (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Dr TAN YIA SWAM (Nominated Member).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for Social Policies.

Mr RAJ JOSHUA THOMAS (Nominated Member).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Law.

-
- 1 Papers presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
- 1.1 Air Navigation (101 – Unmanned Aircraft Operations) (Amendment No. 2) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 11 January 2023 (S. L. 774 of 2023)
 - 1.2 Air Navigation (91 – General Operating Rules) (Amendment No. 2) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 11 January 2023 (S. L. 775 of 2023)
 - 1.3 Air Navigation (Carbon Emissions and Reporting) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 11 January 2023 (S. L. 776 of 2023)
 - 1.4 Air Navigation (92 – Carriage of Dangerous Goods) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 11 January 2023 (S. L. 777 of 2023)
 - 1.5 Air Navigation (Dangerous Goods – Miscellaneous Amendments) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 11 January 2023 (S. L. 778 of 2023)
 - 1.6 Environmental Public Health (General Cleaning Industry) (Amendment) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 13 January 2023 (S. L. 779 of 2023)
 - 1.7 Income Tax (Filing of Estimates of Chargeable Income) (Amendment) Rules 2023 – Presented on 13 January 2023 (S. L. 780 of 2023)
 - 1.8 Legal Profession (Admission) (Amendment) Rules 2023 – Presented on 17 January 2023 (S. L. 781 of 2023)
 - 1.9 Legal Profession (Foreign Practitioner Examinations) (Amendment) Rules 2023 – Presented on 17 January 2023 (S. L. 782 of 2023)
 - 1.10 Third Report of the Public Accounts Committee – Presented on 18 January 2023 (Parl. 16 of 2023)
 - 1.11 Report of the Presidential Council for Minority Rights on the Insolvency, Restructuring and Dissolution (Amendment) Bill [Bill No 37/2022] – Presented on 18 January 2023 (Pres. Co. 78 of 2023)
 - 1.12 Report of the Presidential Council for Minority Rights on the SkillsFuture Singapore Agency (Amendment) Bill [Bill No 38/2022] – Presented on 18 January 2023 (Pres. Co. 79 of 2023)
 - 1.13 Report of the Presidential Council for Minority Rights on the Skills Development Levy (Amendment) Bill [Bill No 39/2022] – Presented on 18 January 2023 (Pres. Co. 80 of 2023)
 - 1.14 Report of the Presidential Council for Minority Rights on the Housing and Development (Amendment) Bill [Bill No 33/2022(Amended)] – Presented on 18 January 2023 (Pres. Co. 81 of 2023)
 - 1.15 Singapore Armed Forces (Pensions) (Amendment) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 18 January 2023 (S. L. 783 of 2023)
 - 1.16 Singapore Armed Forces (Saver Plan) (Amendment) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 18 January 2023 (S. L. 784 of 2023)
 - 1.17 Singapore Armed Forces (Premium Plan) (Amendment) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 18 January 2023 (S. L. 785 of 2023)
 - 1.18 Singapore Armed Forces (Military Domain Experts Service) (Amendment) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 18 January 2023 (S. L. 786 of 2023)

-
- 1.19 Charities (Accounts and Annual Report) (Amendment) Regulations 2023 – Presented on 19 January 2023 (S. L. 787 of 2023)
 - 1.20 Charities (Fund-raising Appeals for Local and Foreign Charitable Purposes) (Amendment) Regulations 2023 – Presented on 19 January 2023 (S. L. 788 of 2023)
 - 1.21 Charities (Miscellaneous Amendments) Regulations 2023 – Presented on 19 January 2023 (S. L. 789 of 2023)
 - 1.22 Charities (Miscellaneous Amendments) (No. 2) Regulations 2023 – Presented on 19 January 2023 (S. L. 790 of 2023)
 - 1.23 Central Provident Fund (Self-Employed Persons) (Amendment) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 20 January 2023 (S. L. 791 of 2023)
 - 1.24 Central Provident Fund (Public Sector Employees) (Amendment No. 2) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 20 January 2023 (S. L. 792 of 2023)
 - 1.25 Central Provident Fund (Revised Workfare Income Supplement Scheme) (Amendment) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 20 January 2023 (S. L. 793 of 2023)
 - 1.26 Central Provident Fund (New Retirement Sum Scheme) (Amendment No. 4) Regulations 2022 – Presented on 20 January 2023 (S. L. 794 of 2023)
 - 1.27 Air Navigation (139 – Aerodromes) Regulations 2023 – Presented on 26 January 2023 (S. L. 795 of 2023)
 - 1.28 Air Navigation (91 – General Operating Rules) (Amendment) Regulations 2023 – Presented on 26 January 2023 (S. L. 796 of 2023)
 - 1.29 Income Tax (Related Party of Approved Shipping Investment Enterprise under Section 13S) (Amendment) Rules 2023 – Presented on 6 February 2023 (S. L. 797 of 2023)
 - 1.30 Income Tax (Related Party of Approved Container Investment Enterprise under Section 43ZA) (Amendment) Rules 2023 – Presented on 6 February 2023 (S. L. 798 of 2023)
 - 2 Extension of Question Time – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mr Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That notwithstanding Standing Order No 22(1), Questions for Oral Answers set down on the Order Paper for today to continue until the completion of Question No 39."
 - 3 39 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
 - 4 Presidential Elections (Amendment) Bill – "to amend the Presidential Elections Act 1991" – presented by the Minister for Education, on behalf of the Prime Minister; read the first time; to be read a second time after the conclusion of proceedings on the Estimates of Expenditure for FY2023/24 and to be printed. [Bill No. 3/2023].
 - 5 Parliamentary Elections (Amendment) Bill – "to amend the Parliamentary Elections Act 1954 and to make consequential and related amendments to certain other Acts" – presented by the Minister for Education, on behalf of the Prime Minister; read the first time; to be read a second time after the conclusion of proceedings on the Estimates of Expenditure for FY2023/24 and to be printed. [Bill No. 2/2023].
 - 6 Resource Sustainability (Amendment) Bill – "to amend the Resource Sustainability Act 2019" – presented by the Senior Minister of State (Dr Amy Khor Lean Suan), on behalf of the Minister for Sustainability and the Environment; read the first time; to be read a second time at the next available sitting on or after 20 March 2023 and to be printed. [Bill No. 4/2023].

-
- 7 COVID-19 (Temporary Measures) (Amendment) Bill – "to amend the COVID-19 (Temporary Measures) Act 2020" – presented by the Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Health; read the first time; to be read a second time after the conclusion of proceedings on the Estimates of Expenditure for FY2023/24 and to be printed. [Bill No. 5/2023].
- 8 Healthcare Services (Amendment) Bill – "to amend the Healthcare Services Act 2020 and to make consequential and related amendments to certain other Acts" – presented by the Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Health; read the first time; to be read a second time after the conclusion of proceedings on the Estimates of Expenditure for FY2023/24 and to be printed. [Bill No. 6/2023].
- 9 Simultaneous Debate on Motions – (Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That, notwithstanding the Standing Orders, the Motions on "Affordable and Accessible Public Housing" and "Public Housing Policies" be taken together, and that the debate on these Motions and on any amendment proposed thereto be proceeded with simultaneously as though the debate were on a single Motion."
- 10 Environmental Public Health (Amendment) Bill – read a second time and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Senior Minister of State (Dr Amy Khor Lean Suan), on behalf of the Minister for Sustainability and the Environment).

(In the Committee)

Clauses 1 to 30 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment; read a third time.

- 11 Time Limit for Speeches – (Deputy Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mr Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) to remove the time limit in respect of the Minister for National Development's speech."
- 12 Affordable and Accessible Public Housing – (Minister for National Development) – Motion made, and Question proposed, "That this House affirms the importance of keeping public housing affordable and accessible while protecting the interests of current and future generations of Singaporeans, and endorses the commitment of the Government to these twin goals."; Debate arising.

Public Housing Policies – (Mr Leong Mun Wai) – Motion made, and Question proposed, Resolved, "That this House calls upon the Government to review its public housing policies in order to deliver affordable and accessible HDB flats to all Singaporeans, strengthen the owner-occupation intent of public housing, protect retirement adequacy and keep public housing inclusive for every Singaporean of each generation."; Debate arising.

Pursuant to the resolution of the House made on 6 February 2023 for the motions on "Affordable and Accessible Public Housing" and "Public Housing Policies" to be taken together, and the debate on these motions and on any amendment proposed thereto be proceeded with simultaneously as though the debate were on a single motion, the House proceeded to debate the two motions simultaneously upon the Questions being proposed.

- 13 Exempted Business – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the business set down on the Order Paper for today be exempted at this day's sitting from the provisions of Standing Order No. 2."

-
- 14 Affordable and Accessible Public Housing – (Minister for National Development) – Debate resumed on Question, "That this House affirms the importance of keeping public housing affordable and accessible while protecting the interests of current and future generations of Singaporeans, and endorses the commitment of the Government to these twin goals."

Public Housing Policies – (Mr Leong Mun Wai) – Debate resumed on Question, "That this House calls upon the Government to review its public housing policies in order to deliver affordable and accessible HDB flats to all Singaporeans, strengthen the owner-occupation intent of public housing, protect retirement adequacy and keep public housing inclusive for every Singaporean of each generation."

- 15 Adjournment of Debate – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the debate be now adjourned."

Debate to be resumed Tomorrow.

- 16 Adjournment – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question proposed, "That Parliament do now adjourn."; Debate arising.

On Question put – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn."

Adjourned at 9.17 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,
Speaker

MEMORANDUM

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 1.30 pm on Tuesday, 7 February 2023.
