

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
THIRTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

---

**Second Session**

---

TUESDAY, 5 NOVEMBER 2019

*No. 114*

**11.00 am**

1

---

---

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Mr AMRIN AMIN (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Health.

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (Fengshan).

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of Education.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Punggol East), Deputy Speaker.

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr ARASU DURAISAMY (Nominated Member).

Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Mr DOUGLAS FOO (Nominated Member).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Leader of the House.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Assoc Prof DANIEL GOH PEI SIONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Mr TERENCE HO WEE SAN (Nominated Member).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance and Second Minister for Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Communications and Information and Government Whip.

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Coordinating Minister for Infrastructure and Minister for Transport.

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Transport.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for National Development and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten), Deputy Speaker.

Mr LIM HNG KLANG (West Coast).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHAMED IRSHAD (Nominated Member).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Mr NG CHEE MENG (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Ms ANTHEA ONG (Nominated Member).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Education.

Mr LEON PERERA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Ms IRENE QUAY SIEW CHING (Nominated Member).

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms SUN XUELING (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (West Coast).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang).

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Assoc Prof WALTER THESEIRA (Nominated Member).

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Health.

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Minister for National Development and Second Minister for Finance.

Prof YAACOB IBRAHIM (Jalan Besar).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr YEE CHIA HSING (Chua Chu Kang).

Ms YIP PIN XIU (Nominated Member).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

ABSENT:

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources and Ministry of Health.

Dr KOH POH KOON (Ang Mo Kio), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Nee Soon).

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast).

Prof LIM SUN SUN (Nominated Member).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr LILY NEO (Jalan Besar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong).

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for Social Policies.

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

---

- 1 Paper presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:

1.1 Legal Profession (Unclaimed Money Fund) Rules 2019 – Presented on 5 November 2019 (S. L. 723 of 2019).

- 2 16 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.

- 3 Supreme Court of Judicature (Amendment) Bill – read a second time and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Law).

*(In the Committee)*

Clauses 1 to 11 inclusive agreed to.

Clause 12:

With the consent of Speaker and assent of the majority of Members present under Standing Order No. 74(3)(a), amendment made, in page 7, line 26, by leaving out "date" and inserting "time".

Clause 12, as amended, agreed to.

Clauses 13 to 32 inclusive agreed to.

The Schedule agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, with an amendment; read a third time.

- 4 Judges' Remuneration (Amendment) Bill – read a second time and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Law).

*(In the Committee)*

Clauses 1 to 5 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment; read a third time.

- 5 Constitution of the Republic of Singapore (Amendment) Bill – (Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Law) – Motion made, and Question proposed, "That the Bill be now read a second time."

On Question put – a division was taken: Ayes 72, No Nil, Abstention Nil.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>No</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Amrin Amin	Nil	Nil
Ang Hin Kee		
Ang Wei Neng		
Baey Yam Keng		
Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl		
Chee Hong Tat		
Chen Show Mao		
Cheng Li Hui		
Chong, Charles		
Choo, Desmond		
Darryl David		
De Souza, Christopher		
Fatimah Lateef		
Foo Chee Keng, Cedric		
Fu Hai Yien, Grace		
Gan Kim Yong		
Gan Thiam Poh		
Goh Chok Tong		
Goh Pei Siong, Daniel		
Heng Chee How		
Indranee Rajah		
Intan Azura Mokhtar		
Iswaran, S.		
Janil Puthucheary		
Khaw Boon Wan		
Lam Pin Min		
Lee Bee Wah		
Lee, Desmond		
Lee Hsien Loong		
Lim Biow Chuan		
Lim Hng Kiang		
Lim Swee Say		
Lim, Sylvia		
Lim Wee Kiak		
Low Thia Kiang		
Low Yen Ling		
Mohamad Maliki Osman		
Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap		
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim		
Murali Pillai		
Ng Chee Meng		
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis		
Ong Teng Koon		
Perera, Leon		
Phua Lay Peng, Denise		
Png Eng Huat		
Pritam Singh		

*Ayes – continued*

Saktiandi Supaat  
Seah Kian Peng  
Shanmugam, K.  
Sim Ann  
Sitoh Yih Pin  
Sun Xueling  
Tan Chin Siong, Sam  
Tan Chuan-Jin  
Tan Lip Fong, Dennis  
Tan Soon Neo, Jessica  
Tay Teck Guan, Patrick  
Teo Chee Hean  
Teo Ho Pin  
Teo, Josephine  
Teo Ser Luck  
Tin Pei Ling  
Tong Chun Fai, Edwin  
Vivian Balakrishnan  
Wong, Lawrence  
Yaacob Ibrahim  
Yam Ziming, Alex  
Yee Chia Hsing  
Yong Yik Chye, Melvin  
Zainal Sapari  
Zaqy Mohamad

Bill accordingly read a second time in accordance with Article 5(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of Singapore and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Law).

*(In the Committee)*

Clauses 1 to 14 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment.

Motion made and Question proposed, "That the Bill be now read a third time." – (Senior Minister of State, on behalf of the Minister for Law).



On Question put – a division was taken: Ayes 72, No Nil, Abstention Nil.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>No</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Amrin Amin	Nil	Nil
Ang Hin Kee		
Ang Wei Neng		
Baey Yam Keng		
Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl		
Chee Hong Tat		
Chen Show Mao		
Cheng Li Hui		
Chong, Charles		
Choo, Desmond		
Darryl David		
De Souza, Christopher		
Fatimah Lateef		
Foo Chee Keng, Cedric		
Fu Hai Yien, Grace		
Gan Kim Yong		
Gan Thiam Poh		
Goh Chok Tong		
Goh Pei Siong, Daniel		
Heng Chee How		
Indranee Rajah		
Intan Azura Mokhtar		
Iswaran, S.		
Janil Puthucheary		
Khaw Boon Wan		
Lam Pin Min		
Lee Bee Wah		
Lee, Desmond		
Lee Hsien Loong		
Lim Biow Chuan		
Lim Hng Kiang		
Lim Swee Say		
Lim, Sylvia		
Lim Wee Kiak		
Low Thia Kiang		
Low Yen Ling		
Mohamad Maliki Osman		
Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap		
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim		
Murali Pillai		
Ng Chee Meng		
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis		
Ong Teng Koon		
Perera, Leon		
Phua Lay Peng, Denise		
Png Eng Huat		
Pritam Singh		

*Ayes – continued*

Saktiandi Supaat  
 Seah Kian Peng  
 Shanmugam, K.  
 Sim Ann  
 Sitoh Yih Pin  
 Sun Xueling  
 Tan Chin Siong, Sam  
 Tan Chuan-Jin  
 Tan Lip Fong, Dennis  
 Tan Soon Neo, Jessica  
 Tay Teck Guan, Patrick  
 Teo Chee Hean  
 Teo Ho Pin  
 Teo, Josephine  
 Teo Ser Luck  
 Tin Pei Ling  
 Tong Chun Fai, Edwin  
 Vivian Balakrishnan  
 Wong, Lawrence  
 Yaacob Ibrahim  
 Yam Ziming, Alex  
 Yee Chia Hsing  
 Yong Yik Chye, Melvin  
 Zainal Sapari  
 Zaqy Mohamad

Bill accordingly read a third time in accordance with Article 5(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of Singapore..

- 6 Subscription to the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development – (Second Minister for Finance (Ms Indranee Rajah)) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That this Parliament, in accordance with section 7(3) of the Bretton Woods Agreement Act (Chapter 27 of the 2012 Revised Edition), resolves that the total subscription of Singapore to the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development be increased to a sum not exceeding Eight Hundred and Fifty-Eight Million United States Dollars (US\$ 858 million).".
- 7 Subscription to the International Development Association – (Second Minister for Finance (Ms Indranee Rajah)) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That this Parliament, in accordance with section 4(2) of the International Development Association Act (Chapter 144A of the 2003 Revised Edition), resolves that the total subscription of Singapore to the International Development Association be increased to a sum not exceeding One Million and Three Hundred Thousand United States Dollars (US\$ 1.3 million).".
- 8 Time Limit for Speeches – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mr Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) to remove the time limit in respect of the Deputy Prime Minister's speech.".
- 9 Governance of Aljunied-Hougang Town Council – (Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance) – Motion made, and Question proposed –
- "That this Parliament:
- (i) affirms the vital importance of Members of Parliament maintaining high standards of integrity and accountability;
  - (ii) notes the Judgment in *Aljunied-Hougang Town Council & anor v Lim Swee Lian Sylvia and ors and anor suit* [2019] SGHC 241, where, amongst other things, the Court held that:

- (a) Ms Sylvia Lim ("Ms Lim") and Mr Low Thia Kiang ("Mr Low") had acted dishonestly and in breach of their fiduciary duties, and their conduct lacked integrity and candour; and
- (b) Ms Lim and Mr Low were fully aware that their conduct was of questionable legality;
- (iii) notes that Ms Lim remains Vice-Chairman of Aljunied-Hougang Town Council, and Mr Low remains an elected member of Aljunied-Hougang Town Council; and
- (iv) calls on Aljunied-Hougang Town Council to discharge their responsibilities to their residents by requiring Ms Lim and Mr Low to recuse themselves from all matters relating to, and oversight over, financial matters."; Debate arising.
- 10 Extension of Sitting – Pursuant to Standing Order 2(5)(d), Mr Speaker extended the sitting beyond the moment of interruption for a period of up to 30 minutes.
- 11 Governance of Aljunied-Hougang Town Council – (Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance) – Debate resumed on Question –
- "That this Parliament:
- (i) affirms the vital importance of Members of Parliament maintaining high standards of integrity and accountability;
- (ii) notes the Judgment in *Aljunied-Hougang Town Council & anor v Lim Swee Lian Sylvia and ors and anor suit* [2019] SGHC 241, where, amongst other things, the Court held that:
- (a) Ms Sylvia Lim ("Ms Lim") and Mr Low Thia Kiang ("Mr Low") had acted dishonestly and in breach of their fiduciary duties, and their conduct lacked integrity and candour; and
- (b) Ms Lim and Mr Low were fully aware that their conduct was of questionable legality;
- (iii) notes that Ms Lim remains Vice-Chairman of Aljunied-Hougang Town Council, and Mr Low remains an elected member of Aljunied-Hougang Town Council; and
- (iv) calls on Aljunied-Hougang Town Council to discharge their responsibilities to their residents by requiring Ms Lim and Mr Low to recuse themselves from all matters relating to, and oversight over, financial matters.".

On Question put – a division was taken: Ayes 52, Noes 9, Abstentions 2.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>Noes</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Amrin Amin	Chen Show Mao	Ong, Anthea
Ang Wei Neng	Goh Pei Siong, Daniel	Theseira, Walter
Baey Yam Keng	Lim, Sylvia	
Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl	Low Thia Kiang	
Chee Hong Tat	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap	
Cheng Li Hui	Perera, Leon	
Choo, Desmond	Png Eng Huat	
Darryl David	Pritam Singh	
Fu Hai Yien, Grace	Tan Lip Fong, Dennis	

*Ayes – continued*

Gan Kim Yong  
Heng Chee How  
Heng Swee Keat  
Ho Wee San, Terence  
Indranee Rajah  
Janil Puthucheary  
Khaw Boon Wan  
Lee Bee Wah  
Lee, Desmond  
Lee Hsien Loong  
Lim Biow Chuan  
Lim Hng Kiang  
Lim Swee Say  
Lim Wee Kiak  
Low Yen Ling  
Mohamed Irshad  
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim  
Murali Pillai  
Ng Chee Meng  
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis  
Ong Teng Koon  
Phua Lay Peng, Denise  
Quay Siew Ching, Irene  
Saktiandi Supaat  
Seah Kian Peng  
Shanmugam, K.  
Sim Ann  
Sitoh Yih Pin  
Sun Xueling  
Tan Chin Siong, Sam  
Tan Chuan-Jin  
Tan Soon Neo, Jessica  
Tay Teck Guan, Patrick  
Teo Ho Pin  
Teo, Josephine  
Tong Chun Fai, Edwin  
Vivian Balakrishnan  
Wong, Lawrence  
Yaacob Ibrahim  
Yam Ziming, Alex  
Yee Chia Hsing  
Yong Yik Chye, Melvin  
Zainal Sapari

Resolved, "That this Parliament:

- (i) affirms the vital importance of Members of Parliament maintaining high standards of integrity and accountability;
- (ii) notes the Judgment in *Aljunied-Hougang Town Council & anor v Lim Swee Lian Sylvia and ors and anor suit* [2019] SGHC 241, where, amongst other things, the Court held that:

- 
- (a) Ms Sylvia Lim ("Ms Lim") and Mr Low Thia Khiang ("Mr Low") had acted dishonestly and in breach of their fiduciary duties, and their conduct lacked integrity and candour; and
- (b) Ms Lim and Mr Low were fully aware that their conduct was of questionable legality;
- (iii) notes that Ms Lim remains Vice-Chairman of Aljunied-Hougang Town Council, and Mr Low remains an elected member of Aljunied-Hougang Town Council; and
- (iv) calls on Aljunied-Hougang Town Council to discharge their responsibilities to their residents by requiring Ms Lim and Mr Low to recuse themselves from all matters relating to, and oversight over, financial matters."
- 12 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to a date to be fixed."

Adjourned at 7.10 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Parliament stands adjourned to a date to be fixed.

---