

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
THIRTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

---

**Second Session**

---

MONDAY, 2 MARCH 2020

*No. 122*

**10.30 am**

1

---

---

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Mr AMRIN AMIN (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Health.

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (Fengshan).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of Education.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Punggol East), Deputy Speaker.

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr ARASU DURAISAMY (Nominated Member).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Mr DOUGLAS FOO (Nominated Member).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Leader of the House.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Assoc Prof DANIEL GOH PEI SIONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Mr TERENCE HO WEE SAN (Nominated Member).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance and Second Minister for Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Communications and Information and Government Whip.

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Coordinating Minister for Infrastructure and Minister for Transport.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources and Ministry of Health.

Dr KOH POH KOON (Ang Mo Kio), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Nee Soon).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Transport.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for National Development and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten), Deputy Speaker.

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast).

Prof LIM SUN SUN (Nominated Member).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHAMED IRSHAD (Nominated Member).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Dr LILY NEO (Jalan Besar).

Mr NG CHEE MENG (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Ms ANTHEA ONG (Nominated Member).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Education.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Ms IRENE QUAY SIEW CHING (Nominated Member).

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong).

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITOY YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms SUN XUELING (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (West Coast).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang).

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for Social Policies.

Assoc Prof WALTER THESEIRA (Nominated Member).

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Health.

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Minister for National Development and Second Minister for Finance.

Prof YAACOB IBRAHIM (Jalan Besar).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr YEE CHIA HSING (Chua Chu Kang).

Ms YIP PIN XIU (Nominated Member).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

ABSENT:

Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast).

---

- 1 1 Question for Oral Answer was answered during Question Time.
- 2 Supplementary Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1 April 2019 to 31 March 2020 (Paper Cmd. 25 of 2020) – Committee of Supply (Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

*(In the Committee)*

Supplementary Main Estimates  
of Expenditure for FY2019/2020

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Main Estimates.

<i>Head</i>	\$
Q Ministry of Communications and Information	65,220,000
S Ministry of Manpower	50,042,700
T Ministry of National Development	151,107,700
V Ministry of Trade and Industry	96,328,300
X Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth	5,190,600
Z Financial Transfers	8,000,000

Resolved, "That the sum of \$375,889,300 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Main Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1 April 2019 to 31 March 2020, contained in Paper Cmd. 25 of 2020."

Resolution to be reported.

Supplementary Development Estimates  
of Expenditure for FY2019/2020

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Development Estimates.

<i>Head</i>	\$
C Auditor-General's Office	59,600
K Ministry of Education	81,300,000
Q Ministry of Communications and Information	15,429,300

Resolved, "That the sum of \$96,788,900 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Development Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1 April 2019 to 31 March 2020, contained in Paper Cmd. 25 of 2020."

Resolution to be reported.

Resolutions reported and agreed to.

- 3 Estimates for the financial year 1 April 2020 to 31 March 2021 (Paper Cmd. 24 of 2020) – Committee of Supply (2<sup>nd</sup> Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

*(In the Committee)*

Head P – Ministry of Home Affairs –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head P of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Christopher de Souza).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$6,184,681,500 for Head P agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$814,275,900 for Head P agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head J – Ministry of Defence –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head J of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Vikram Nair).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$14,561,155,500 for Head J agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$889,200,000 for Head J agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head N – Ministry of Foreign Affairs –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head N of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Vikram Nair).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$450,109,100 for Head N agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$11,500,000 for Head N agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head V – Ministry of Trade and Industry –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head V of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Liang Eng Hwa); Debate arising.

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker (Mr Charles Chong), Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported now and leave be asked to sit again tomorrow." – (Leader of the House).

Progress reported – (Leader of the House).

Committee to sit again Tomorrow.

- 
- 4 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to 10.00 am tomorrow."

Adjourned at 6.48 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 10.00 am on Tuesday, 3 March 2020.

---