

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE
FOURTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

First Session

TUESDAY, 15 FEBRUARY 2022

No. 48

12.30 pm

1

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Ms JANET ANG (Nominated Member).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (West Coast).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Transport.

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Education.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (East Coast).

Mr MARK CHAY (Nominated Member).

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Transport.

Mr CHENG HSING YAO (Nominated Member).

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr ERIC CHUA (Tanjong Pagar) Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr CHUA KHENG WEE LOUIS (Sengkang).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah), Deputy Speaker.

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Sustainability and the Environment.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Ms GAN SIOW HUANG (Marymount), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Aljunied).

Mr DERRICK GOH (Nee Soon).

Ms HE TING RU (Sengkang).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (East Coast), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for Economic Policies.

Prof HOON HIAN TECK (Nominated Member).

Mr SHAWN HUANG WEI ZHONG (Jurong).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance, Second Minister for National Development and Leader of the House.

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Transport and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Health and Government Whip.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.

Prof KOH LIAN PIN (Nominated Member).

Dr KOH POH KOON (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Kebun Baru).

Mr DESMOND LEE (West Coast), Minister for National Development and Minister-in-charge of Social Services Integration.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEONG MUN WAI (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Bukit Panjang).

Mr LIM BIEW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Assoc Prof JAMUS JEROME LIM (Sengkang).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms MARIAM JAAFAR (Sembawang).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for Social and Family Development, Second Minister for Health and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Education and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHD FAHMI BIN ALIMAN (Marine Parade).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Ms NADIA AHMAD SAMDIN (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms NG LING LING (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Miss RACHEL ONG (West Coast).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Health.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Aljunied).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Ms HAZEL POA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms POH LI SAN (Sembawang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied), Leader of the Opposition.

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong), Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Health.

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Dr SHAHIRA ABDULLAH (Nominated Member).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Mr SHARAEL TAHA (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of National Development and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms HANY SOH (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms SUN XUELING (Punggol West), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr ALVIN TAN (Tanjong Pagar), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms CARRIE TAN (Nee Soon).

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Hougang).

Mr DESMOND TAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment.

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast), Deputy Speaker.

Mr TAN KIAT HOW (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of National Development.

Dr TAN SEE LENG (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong).

Dr TAN YIA SWAM (Nominated Member).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Pioneer).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Jalan Besar), Minister for Communications and Information and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for Social Policies.

Mr RAJ JOSHUA THOMAS (Nominated Member).

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Law.

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr WAN RIZAL (Jalan Besar).

Mr DON WEE (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Minister for Finance.

Mr XIE YAO QUAN (Jurong).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms YEO WAN LING (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr YIP HON WENG (Yio Chu Kang).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Radin Mas).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr ZHULKARNAIN ABDUL RAHIM (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr ABDUL SAMAD (Nominated Member).

Mr EDWARD CHIA BING HUI (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

-
- 1 16 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time. With leave of Mr Speaker, 5 other Questions for Oral Answer were addressed in the subsequent Ministerial Statements.
 - 2 Ministerial Statement – Bolstering the Security of Digital Banking – (Minister for Finance).
 - 3 Ministerial Statement – Combatting Online Phishing and Spoofing Scams – (Minister for Communications and Information).
 - 4 Ministerial Statement – Strengthening Enforcement and Public Education – With leave of Mr Speaker, Minister of State for Home Affairs (Mr Desmond Tan) delivered the Ministerial Statement on behalf of the Minister for Home Affairs.
 - 5 Simultaneous Debate on Motions – (Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That, notwithstanding the Standing Orders, the motions on (a) "Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan)", and (b) "Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim)", be taken together, and the debate on these motions and on any amendment proposed thereto be proceeded with simultaneously as though the debate were on a single motion."
 - 6 Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan) – (Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question proposed, "That this Parliament:
 1. Takes note of the Special Reports of the Committee of Privileges contained in:
 - (a) Paper Parl. 5 of 2021;
 - (b) Paper Parl. 6 of 2021;
 - (c) Paper Parl. 7 of 2021;
 - (d) Paper Parl. 8 of 2021;
 - (e) Paper Parl. 9 of 2021;
 - (f) Paper Parl. 10 of 2021;
 - (g) Paper Parl. 11 of 2021; and
 2. Agrees with the recommendations of the Committee of Privileges relating to Ms Raeesah Khan, as stated in the Committee's Report contained in Paper Parl 13 of 2022, and resolves:
 - (a) that Ms Raeesah Khan is guilty of abuse of the privileges of Parliament for an untruth ("Untruth") spoken in Parliament on 3 August 2021 (twice) and repeated on 4 October 2021;
 - (b) that a fine of S\$25,000 be imposed on her for stating the Untruth twice in Parliament on 3 August 2021; and
 - (c) that a fine of S\$10,000 be imposed on her for repeating the Untruth on 4 October 2021. "

Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim) – (Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question proposed, “That this Parliament:

1. Notes that it appears from the Report of the Committee of Privileges (Paper Parl. 13 of 2022) (“Report”) that offences under Part 5 of the Parliament (Privileges, Immunities and Powers) Act may have been committed before the Committee of Privileges;
2. Resolves, under section 21(1)(c) of the Parliament (Privileges, Immunities and Powers) Act, to refer the conduct of Mr Pritam Singh and Mr Muhamad Faisal Bin Abdul Manap before the Committee to the Public Prosecutor; and
3. Further resolves that findings in the Report regarding:
 - i. Mr Singh’s, Ms Sylvia Lim’s and/or Mr Faisal’s respective roles as set out in the Report, in relation to the untruth spoken by Ms Raeesah Khan in Parliament on 3 August 2021 (twice) and repeated on 4 October 2021;
 - ii. Ms Lim / Mr Faisal’s stating of untruths to the Committee on oath/affirmation; and the appropriate sanctions in respect thereof, be deferred until after the conclusion of the investigations and criminal proceedings (if any) against Mr Singh.

Pursuant to the earlier resolution of the House for the motions on Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan) and Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim) be taken together, and the debate on these motions and on any amendment proposed thereto be proceeded with simultaneously as though the debate were on a single motion, the House proceeded to debate the two motions simultaneously upon the Questions being proposed.

7 Time Limit for Speeches – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mr Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) to remove the time limit in respect of the Prime Minister’s speech."

8 Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan) – Debate resumed on Question, “That this Parliament:

1. Takes note of the Special Reports of the Committee of Privileges contained in:
 - (a) Paper Parl. 5 of 2021;
 - (b) Paper Parl. 6 of 2021;
 - (c) Paper Parl. 7 of 2021;
 - (d) Paper Parl. 8 of 2021;
 - (e) Paper Parl. 9 of 2021;
 - (f) Paper Parl. 10 of 2021;
 - (g) Paper Parl. 11 of 2021; and
2. Agrees with the recommendations of the Committee of Privileges relating to Ms Raeesah Khan, as stated in the Committee’s Report contained in Paper Parl 13 of 2022, and resolves:
 - (a) that Ms Raeesah Khan is guilty of abuse of the privileges of Parliament for an untruth (“Untruth”) spoken in Parliament on 3 August 2021 (twice) and repeated on 4 October 2021;
 - (b) that a fine of S\$25,000 be imposed on her for stating the Untruth twice in Parliament on 3 August 2021; and
 - (c) that a fine of S\$10,000 be imposed on her for repeating the Untruth on 4 October 2021.”.

Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim) – Debate resumed on Question, “That this Parliament:

1. Notes that it appears from the Report of the Committee of Privileges (Paper Parl. 13 of 2022) (“Report”) that offences under Part 5 of the Parliament (Privileges, Immunities and Powers) Act may have been committed before the Committee of Privileges;
2. Resolves, under section 21(1)(c) of the Parliament (Privileges, Immunities and Powers) Act, to refer the conduct of Mr Pritam Singh and Mr Muhamad Faisal Bin Abdul Manap before the Committee to the Public Prosecutor; and
3. Further resolves that findings in the Report regarding:
 - i. Mr Singh’s, Ms Sylvia Lim’s and/or Mr Faisal’s respective roles as set out in the Report, in relation to the untruth spoken by Ms Raeesah Khan in Parliament on 3 August 2021 (twice) and repeated on 4 October 2021;
 - ii. Ms Lim / Mr Faisal’s stating of untruths to the Committee on oath/affirmation; and the appropriate sanctions in respect thereof, be deferred until after the conclusion of the investigations and criminal proceedings (if any) against Mr Singh.”.

9 Exempted Business – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, “That the proceedings on the business set down on the Order Paper for today be exempted at today’s sitting from the provisions of Standing Order No. 2.”.

10 Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan) – Debate resumed on Question, “That this Parliament:

1. Takes note of the Special Reports of the Committee of Privileges contained in:
 - (a) Paper Parl. 5 of 2021;
 - (b) Paper Parl. 6 of 2021;
 - (c) Paper Parl. 7 of 2021;
 - (d) Paper Parl. 8 of 2021;
 - (e) Paper Parl. 9 of 2021;
 - (f) Paper Parl. 10 of 2021;
 - (g) Paper Parl. 11 of 2021; and
2. Agrees with the recommendations of the Committee of Privileges relating to Ms Raeesah Khan, as stated in the Committee’s Report contained in Paper Parl 13 of 2022, and resolves:
 - (a) that Ms Raeesah Khan is guilty of abuse of the privileges of Parliament for an untruth (“Untruth”) spoken in Parliament on 3 August 2021 (twice) and repeated on 4 October 2021;
 - (b) that a fine of S\$25,000 be imposed on her for stating the Untruth twice in Parliament on 3 August 2021; and
 - (c) that a fine of S\$10,000 be imposed on her for repeating the Untruth on 4 October 2021. ”.

Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim) – Debate resumed on Question, “That this Parliament:

1. Notes that it appears from the Report of the Committee of Privileges (Paper Parl. 13 of 2022) (“Report”) that offences under Part 5 of the Parliament (Privileges, Immunities and Powers) Act may have been committed before the Committee of Privileges;
2. Resolves, under section 21(1)(c) of the Parliament (Privileges, Immunities and Powers) Act, to refer the conduct of Mr Pritam Singh and Mr Muhamad Faisal Bin Abdul Manap before the Committee to the Public Prosecutor; and

3. Further resolves that findings in the Report regarding:
- i. Mr Singh's, Ms Sylvia Lim's and/or Mr Faisal's respective roles as set out in the Report, in relation to the untruth spoken by Ms Raeesah Khan in Parliament on 3 August 2021 (twice) and repeated on 4 October 2021;
 - ii. Ms Lim / Mr Faisal's stating of untruths to the Committee on oath/affirmation; and the appropriate sanctions in respect thereof, be deferred until after the conclusion of the investigations and criminal proceedings (if any) against Mr Singh.”.
- 11 Manner of Putting and Voting on the Motion on Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan) – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mr Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, “That, notwithstanding the Standing Orders, the question on the first Motion in respect of the "Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan)", be put and voted in two parts, that the first question be put upon, paragraphs 1 and 2(a)-(b) of the Motion, and that the second question be put upon paragraph 2(c) of the Motion.”.
- 12 Manner of Putting and Voting on the Motion on Committee of Privileges Report ((Recommendations in respect of Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim) – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mr Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, “That, notwithstanding the Standing Orders, the question on the second Motion in respect of the "Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect to Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim)", be put and voted in two parts, that the first question be put upon paragraphs 1 and 2 of the Motion and that the second question be put upon paragraph 3 of the Motion.”.
- 13 Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan) (No.1) – Question put – Resolved, “That this Parliament:
1. Takes note of the Special Reports of the Committee of Privileges contained in:
 - (a) Paper Parl. 5 of 2021;
 - (b) Paper Parl. 6 of 2021;
 - (c) Paper Parl. 7 of 2021;
 - (d) Paper Parl. 8 of 2021;
 - (e) Paper Parl. 9 of 2021;
 - (f) Paper Parl. 10 of 2021;
 - (g) Paper Parl. 11 of 2021; and
 2. Agrees with the recommendations of the Committee of Privileges relating to Ms Raeesah Khan, as stated in the Committee's Report contained in Paper Parl 13 of 2022, and resolves:
 - (a) that Ms Raeesah Khan is guilty of abuse of the privileges of Parliament for an untruth (“Untruth”) spoken in Parliament on 3 August 2021 (twice) and repeated on 4 October 2021; and
 - (b) that a fine of S\$25,000 be imposed on her for stating the Untruth twice in Parliament on 3 August 2021.”.
- 14 Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect of Ms Raeesah Khan) (No.2) – Question put, “That this Parliament agrees with the recommendations of the Committee of Privileges relating to Ms Raeesah Khan, as stated in the Committee's Report contained in Paper Parl 13 of 2022, and resolves that a fine of S\$10,000 be imposed on Ms Raeesah Khan for repeating the Untruth on 4 October 2021.”.

Question agreed to with the following Members dissenting:-

Mr Chua Kheng Wee Louis (Sengkang)
 Mr Gerald Giam Yean Song (Aljunied)
 Ms He Ting Ru (Sengkang)
 Mr Leong Mun Wai (Non-Constituency Member)
 Assoc Prof Jamus Jerome Lim (Sengkang)
 Ms Sylvia Lim (Aljunied)
 Mr Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
 Mr Leon Perera (Aljunied)

Ms Hazel Poa (Non-Constituency Member)
Mr Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
Mr Dennis Tan Lip Fong (Hougang)

- 15 Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect to Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim) (No.1) – Question put, “That this Parliament:

1. Notes that it appears from the Report of the Committee of Privileges (Paper Parl. 13 of 2022) (“Report”) that offences under Part 5 of the Parliament (Privileges, Immunities and Powers) Act may have been committed before the Committee of Privileges; and
2. Resolves, under section 21(1)(c) of the Parliament (Privileges, Immunities and Powers) Act, to refer the conduct of Mr Pritam Singh and Mr Muhamad Faisal Bin Abdul Manap before the Committee to the Public Prosecutor.”.

Question agreed to with the following Members dissenting:-

Mr Chua Kheng Wee Louis (Sengkang)
Mr Gerald Giam Yean Song (Aljunied)
Ms He Ting Ru (Sengkang)
Assoc Prof Jamus Jerome Lim (Sengkang)
Ms Sylvia Lim (Aljunied)
Mr Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
Mr Leon Perera (Aljunied)
Mr Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
Mr Dennis Tan Lip Fong (Hougang)

- 16 Committee of Privileges Report (Recommendations in respect to Mr Pritam Singh, Mr Faisal Manap and Ms Sylvia Lim) (No.2) – Question put, “That this Parliament resolves that findings in the Report regarding:

- i. Mr Singh’s, Ms Sylvia Lim’s and/or Mr Faisal’s respective roles as set out in the Report, in relation to the untruth spoken by Ms Raeesah Khan in Parliament on 3 August 2021 (twice) and repeated on 4 October 2021;
 - ii. Ms Lim / Mr Faisal’s stating of untruths to the Committee on oath/affirmation;
- and the appropriate sanctions in respect thereof, be deferred until after the conclusion of the investigations and criminal proceedings (if any) against Mr Singh.”.

Question agreed to with the following Members dissenting:-

Mr Chua Kheng Wee Louis (Sengkang)
Mr Gerald Giam Yean Song (Aljunied)
Ms He Ting Ru (Sengkang)
Assoc Prof Jamus Jerome Lim (Sengkang)
Ms Sylvia Lim (Aljunied)
Mr Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap (Aljunied)
Mr Leon Perera (Aljunied)
Mr Pritam Singh (Aljunied)
Mr Dennis Tan Lip Fong (Hougang)

- 17 Adjournment – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That at its rising today, Parliament do stand adjourned to Friday, 18 February 2022."

18 Adjournment – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question proposed "That Parliament do now adjourn"; Debate arising.

And the Question having been proposed at 7.47 pm and the Debate having continued until half an hour had passed, Mr Speaker adjourned Parliament without Question put, pursuant to the Standing Order.

Adjourned at 8.19 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,
Speaker

MEMORANDUM

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 1.30 pm on Friday, 18 February 2022.
