

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
THIRTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

---

**First Session**

---

WEDNESDAY, 9 NOVEMBER 2016

No. 28

**12 noon**

1

---

---

PRESENT:

Mdm SPEAKER (Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Marsiling-Yew Tee)).

Mr AMRIN AMIN (Sembawang), Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs.

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr AZMOON AHMAD (Nominated Member).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (Fengshan).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office and Government Whip.

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Health.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms CHIA YONG YONG (Nominated Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Punggol East), Deputy Speaker.

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Assoc Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Leader of the House.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Assoc Prof DANIEL GOH PEI SIONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Law.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry (Industry).

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Education.

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Coordinating Minister for Infrastructure and Minister for Transport.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources and Ministry of Health.

Dr KOH POH KOON (Ang Mo Kio), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr KOK HENG LEUN (Nominated Member).

Ms KUIK SHIAO-YIN (Nominated Member).

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Nee Soon).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Minister of State, Ministry of Health.

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten), Deputy Speaker.

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry (Trade).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister for Manpower.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Asst Prof MAHDEV MOHAN (Nominated Member).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Dr LILY NEO (Jalan Besar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Education (Higher Education and Skills) and Second Minister for Defence.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Non-Constituency Member).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong).

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITOY YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Mr TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister for Social and Family Development.

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Assoc Prof RANDOLPH TAN (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (West Coast).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang).

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Manpower.

Ms K THANALETCHIMI (Nominated Member).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for Economic and Social Policies.

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Minister for National Development and Second Minister for Finance.

Assoc Prof Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Jalan Besar), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Mr YEE CHIA HSING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr THOMAS CHUA KEE SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr GANESH RAJARAM (Nominated Member).

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Finance.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Mr NG CHEE MENG (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister for Education (Schools) and Second Minister for Transport.

Ms SUN XUELING (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

---

- 1 Papers presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
- 1.1 Road Traffic (Expressway Traffic) (Amendment) Rules 2016 – Presented on 9 November 2016 (S. L. 183 of 2016).
- 1.2 Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council's Audited Financial Statements, Auditors' Reports and Annual Report for FY2014/2015 – Presented on 9 November 2016 (S. 191 of 2016).
- 2 15 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 Active Mobility Bill – "for the establishment of public paths for walking, cycling or other similar purposes, to regulate the use of these public paths, and to make consequential and related amendments to certain other Acts" – presented by the Minister for Transport; read the first time; to be read a second time on the next available sitting day and to be printed. [Bill No. 40/2016].
- 4 Constitution of the Republic of Singapore (Amendment) Bill – (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security) – Question again proposed on the resumption of debate, "That the Bill be now read a second time."; Debate resumed.
- 5 Time Limit for Speeches – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mdm Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) to remove the time limit in respect of Deputy Prime Minister Teo Chee Hean's speech."
- 6 Constitution of the Republic of Singapore (Amendment) Bill – (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security) – Debate resumed on Question, "That the Bill be now read a second time."
- 7 Exempted Business – (Leader of the House) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the business set down on the Order Paper for today be exempted at this day's sitting from the provisions of Standing Order No. 2."
- 8 Constitution of the Republic of Singapore (Amendment) Bill – (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security) – Debate resumed on Question, "That the Bill be now read a second time."

On Question put, – a division was taken: Ayes 77, Noes 6, Abstention 0.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>Noes</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Amrin Amin	Chen Show Mao	Nil
Ang Hin Kee	Lim, Sylvia	
Ang Wei Neng	Low Thia Kiang	
Baey Yam Keng	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap	
Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl	Png Eng Huat	
Chan Chun Sing	Pritam Singh	
Chee Hong Tat		
Cheng Li Hui		
Chia Shi-Lu		
Chong, Charles		
Chong Kee Hiong		
Choo, Desmond		

*Ayes – continued*

Darryl David  
De Souza, Christopher  
Fatimah Lateef  
Foo Chee Keng, Cedric  
Foo Mee Har  
Fu Hai Yien, Grace  
Gan Kim Yong  
Gan Thiam Poh  
Goh Chok Tong  
Halimah Yacob  
Heng Chee How  
Indranee Rajah  
Intan Azura Mokhtar  
Iswaran, S.  
Janil Puthuchery  
Khaw Boon Wan  
Khor Lean Suan, Amy  
Koh Poh Koon  
Kwek Hian Chuan, Henry  
Lam Pin Min  
Lee, Desmond  
Lee Hsien Loong  
Lee Yi Shyan  
Liang Eng Hwa  
Lim Biow Chuan  
Lim Hng Kiang  
Lim Swee Say  
Lim Wee Kiak  
Low Yen Ling  
Masagos Zulkifli B M M  
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim  
Murali Pillai  
Neo, Lily  
Ng Eng Hen  
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis  
Ong Teng Koon  
Ong Ye Kung  
Pereira, Joan  
Phua Lay Peng, Denise  
Rahayu Mahzam  
Saktiandi Supaat  
Seah Kian Peng  
Shanmugam, K.  
Sim Ann  
Sitoh Yih Pin  
Tan Chuan-Jin  
Tan Soon Neo, Jessica  
Tan Chin Siong, Sam  
Tan Wu Meng  
Tay Teck Guan, Patrick  
Teo Chee Hean  
Teo Ho Pin  
Teo, Josephine  
Teo Ser Luck

*Ayes – continued*

Tharman Shanmugaratnam  
Tin Pei Ling  
Tong Chun Fai, Edwin  
Vikram Nair  
Wong, Lawrence  
Yaacob Ibrahim  
Yam Ziming, Alex  
Yee Chia Hsing  
Yong Yik Chye, Melvin  
Zainal Sapari  
Zaqy Mohamad

Bill accordingly read a second time in accordance with Article 5(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of Singapore and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security).

*(In the Committee)*

Clauses 1 to 21 inclusive agreed to.

Clause 22:

Amendment made in page 33, after line 30, by inserting –

"(3) Despite clause (1) –

- (a) a refusal by the President to approve a budget, revised budget or supplementary budget of an entity specified in the Fifth Schedule; and
- (b) a decision by the President to disapprove under Article 22B(7) or 22D(6) a proposed transaction by an entity specified in the Fifth Schedule,

cannot be overruled unless the chairman of the entity or the chairman of the board of directors of the entity (as the case may be) has made a request to the Cabinet for a resolution under clause (1) to be moved with respect to the refusal or the decision."  
– (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security).

Consequential amendments made:

- (i) in page 33, line 31, by renumbering clause (3) as clause (4).
- (ii) in page 34, line 7, by renumbering clause (4) as clause (5).

Clause 22, as amended, agreed to.

Clauses 23 to 35 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, with amendments.

Motion made and Question proposed, "That the Bill be now read a third time." – (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security).

On Question put, – a division was taken: Ayes 77, Noes 6, Abstention 0.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>Noes</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Amrin Amin	Chen Show Mao	Nil
Ang Hin Kee	Lim, Sylvia	
Ang Wei Neng	Low Thia Kiang	
Baey Yam Keng	Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap	
Chan Wei Ling, Cheryl	Png Eng Huat	
Chan Chun Sing	Pritam Singh	
Chee Hong Tat		
Cheng Li Hui		
Chia Shi-Lu		
Chong, Charles		
Chong Kee Hiong		
Choo, Desmond		
Darryl David		
De Souza, Christopher		
Fatimah Lateef		
Foo Chee Keng, Cedric		
Foo Mee Har		
Fu Hai Yien, Grace		
Gan Kim Yong		
Gan Thiam Poh		
Goh Chok Tong		
Halimah Yacob		
Heng Chee How		
Indranee Rajah		
Intan Azura Mokhtar		
Iswaran, S.		
Janil Puthucheary		
Khaw Boon Wan		
Khor Lean Suan, Amy		
Koh Poh Koon		
Kwek Hian Chuan, Henry		
Lam Pin Min		
Lee, Desmond		
Lee Hsien Loong		
Lee Yi Shyan		
Liang Eng Hwa		
Lim Biow Chuan		
Lim Hng Kiang		
Lim Swee Say		
Lim Wee Kiak		
Low Yen Ling		
Masagos Zulkifli B M M		
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim		
Murali Pillai		
Neo, Lily		
Ng Eng Hen		
Ng Kok Kwang, Louis		

*Ayes – continued*

Ong Teng Koon  
Ong Ye Kung  
Pereira, Joan  
Phua Lay Peng, Denise  
Rahayu Mahzam  
Saktiandi Supaat  
Seah Kian Peng  
Shanmugam, K.  
Sim Ann  
Sitoh Yih Pin  
Tan Chuan-Jin  
Tan Soon Neo, Jessica  
Tan Chin Siong, Sam  
Tan Wu Meng  
Tay Teck Guan, Patrick  
Teo Chee Hean  
Teo Ho Pin  
Teo, Josephine  
Teo Ser Luck  
Tharman Shanmugaratnam  
Tin Pei Ling  
Tong Chun Fai, Edwin  
Vikram Nair  
Wong, Lawrence  
Yaacob Ibrahim  
Yam Ziming, Alex  
Yee Chia Hsing  
Yong Yik Chye, Melvin  
Zainal Sapari  
Zaqy Mohamad

Bill accordingly read a third time in accordance with Article 5(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of Singapore.

- 9 Credit Bureau Bill – read a second time and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Minister for Education (Higher Education and Skills), on behalf of the Prime Minister).

*(In the Committee)*

Clauses 1 to 84 inclusive agreed to.

First and Second Schedules agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment; read a third time.

- 
- 10 Adjournment – (Government Whip) – Resolved "That Parliament do now adjourn to tomorrow at 12 noon."

Adjourned at 8.15 pm

HALIMAH YACOB,  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Mdm Speaker will take the Chair again at 12 noon on Thursday, 10 November 2016.

---