VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE

First Session

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2012

No. 20 **11.00 am** 126

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr MICHAEL PALMER (Punggol East)).

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Acting Minister for Community Development, Youth and Sports and Minister of State, Ministry of Information, Communications and the Arts.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Ms FAIZAH JAMAL (Nominated Member).

Mr NICHOLAS FANG (Nominated Member).

Assoc. Prof. FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Information,

Communications and the Arts and Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong), Minister of State, Ministry of Community Development, Youth and Sports.

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms JANICE KOH (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West).

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr DESMOND LEE TI-SENG (Jurong).

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LAURENCE LIEN (Nominated Member).

Ms MARY LIEW (Nominated Member).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Defence and Minister for National Development.

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc. Prof. Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon).

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr R DHINAKARAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Law.

Mr SITOH YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Acting Minister for Community Development, Youth and Sports.

BG (NS) TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development and Ministry of Manpower.

Asst. Prof. TAN KHENG BOON EUGENE (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister, Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr TEO SIONG SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister, Minister for Finance and Minister for Manpower.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Education

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Ms TAN SU SHAN (Nominated Member).

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Assoc. Prof. Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Information, Communications and the Arts and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

Estimates for the financial year 1st April 2012 to 31st March 2013 (Paper Cmd. 2 of 2012)

- Committee of Supply (4th Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

(In the Committee)

Head J - Ministry of Defence -

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head J of the Estimates be reduced by \$100.". – (Dr Lim Wee Kiak).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$11,789,000,000 for Head J agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$490,000,000 for Head J agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head N - Ministry of Foreign Affairs -

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head N of the Estimates be reduced by 100.". – (Dr Lim Wee Kiak).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$357,989,300 for Head N agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$45,000,000 for Head N agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head R - Ministry of Law -

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head R of the Estimates be reduced by 100.". – (Mr Hri Kumar Nair).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$199,958,800 for Head R agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$340,236,700 for Head R agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head L - Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources -

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head L of the Estimates be reduced by 100.". – (Er Dr Lee Bee Wah).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$829,926,000 for Head L agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$474,034,600 for Head L agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head O - Ministry of Health -

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head O of the Estimates be reduced by \$100.". – (Dr Lam Pin Min); Debate arising.

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker, Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the Chairman do leave the Chair".

Mr Deputy Speaker suspended the proceedings of the Committee and resumed the Chair of the House.

- Exempted Business (Government Whip) (With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker and general assent of Members present) Motion made, and Question put Resolved, "That the proceedings on the business of Supply be proceeded with beyond 7.30 pm.".
- Estimates for the financial year 1st April 2012 to 31st March 2013 (Paper Cmd. 2 of 2012) Consideration in the Committee of Supply resumed.

(In the Committee)

Head O - Ministry of Health -

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head O of the Estimates be reduced by 100.". – (Dr Lam Pin Min).

Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported now and leave be asked to sit again tomorrow.". – (Minister for Health).

Progress reported – (Minister for Health).

Committee to sit again Tomorrow.

4 Adjournment – (Government Whip) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn.".

Adjourned at 7.48 pm

MICHAEL PALMER Speaker

MEMORANDUM

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 11.00 am on Wednesday, 7 March 2012.