# **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

## **Second Session**

# TUESDAY, 4 NOVEMBER 2014

No. 17

## 1.30 pm

123

## PRESENT:

Mdm SPEAKER (Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong)).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for Defence.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms CHIA YONG YONG (Nominated Member).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr THOMAS CHUA KEE SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Assoc Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr K KARTHIKEYAN (Nominated Member).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Minister of State, Ministry of Health.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms LEE LI LIAN (Punggol East).

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development.

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Social and Family Development and Minister for Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport.

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHD ISMAIL HUSSEIN (Nominated Member).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Health and Minister for Transport.

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Communications and Information.

Mr SITOH YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms RITA SOH SIOW LAN (Nominated Member).

Mr TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower.

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Prof TAN TAI YONG (Nominated Member).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Communications and Information.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

### ABSENT:

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms KUIK SHIAO-YIN (Nominated Member).

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of National Development.

Dr BENEDICT TAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Assoc Prof Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

- 1 Papers presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
  - 1.1 Public Utilities (Water Supply) (Amendment) Regulations 2014 Presented on 4 November 2014 (S. L. 167 of 2014).
  - 1.2 Sewerage and Drainage (Trade Effluent) (Amendment) Regulations 2014 Presented on 4 November 2014 (S. L. 168 of 2014).
- 2 14 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 Pawnbrokers Bill "to repeal and re-enact the Pawnbrokers Act (Chapter 222 of the 1994 Revised Edition) and to make consequential amendments to certain other written laws" – presented by the Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law; read the first time; to be read a second time on the next available sitting day and to be printed. [Bill No. 42/2014].
- 4 Foreign Employee Dormitories Bill "to provide for the regulation of operators of dormitories for foreign employees and for matters connected with or incidental to that" presented by the Minister for Manpower; read the first time; to be read a second time on the next available sitting day and to be printed. [Bill No. 43/2014].
- 5 Constitution of the Republic of Singapore (Amendment) Bill Motion made, and Question proposed, "That the Bill be now read a second time." (Minister for Law).

On Question put, - a division was taken: Ayes 68, Noes 7, Absention 0.

Ayes

Noes

Pritam Singh

Abstention

Ang Wei Neng Baey Yam Keng Chan Chun Sing Chia Shi-Lu Chong, Charles Fatimah Lateef Fong, Arthur Foo Chee Keng, Cedric Foo Mee Har Fu Hai Yien, Grace Gan Kim Yong Gan Thiam Poh Goh Chok Tong Halimah Yacob Heng Chee How Heng Swee Keat Hri Kumar Nair Inderjit Singh Indranee Rajah Intan Azura Mokhtar Iswaran, S. Janil Puthucheary

Chen Show Mao Lee Li Lian Lim, Sylvia Low Thia Khiang Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap Png Eng Huat Ayes - continued

Khaw Boon Wan Khor Lean Suan, Amy Lam Pin Min Lee Bee Wah Lee, Desmond Lee, Ellen Lee Hsien Loong Lee Yi Shyan Lim Biow Chuan Lim Hng Kiang Lim Siang Keat, Raymond Lim Swee Say Lim Wee Kiak Low, Penny Low Yen Ling Lui Tuck Yew Mah Bow Tan Masagos Zulkifli B M M Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim Neo, Lily Ng Eng Hen Ng Phek Hoong, Irene Ong Kim Huat, David Ong Teng Koon Phua Lay Peng, Denise Seah Kian Peng Seng Han Thong Shanmugam, K. Sim Ann Sitoh Yih Pin Tan Chuan-Jin Tan, Jessica Tay Teck Guan, Patrick Teo, Josephine Teo Ser Luck Tharman Shanmugaratnam Tin Pei Ling Tong Chun Fai, Edwin Vikram Nair Vivian Balakrishnan Wong, Lawrence Yam Ziming, Alex Yeo, Alvin Yeo Guat Kwang Zainal Sapari Zaqy Mohamad

Bill accordingly read a second time in accordance with Article 5(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of Singapore and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Minister for Law).

(In the Committee)

Clauses 1 to 18 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment.

Motion made and Question proposed, "That the Bill be now read a third time.". – (Minister for Law).

On Question put, - a division was taken: Ayes 69, Noes 7, Abstention 0

Ayes

Noes

Abstention

Ang Wei Neng Chen Show Mao Baey Yam Keng Lee Li Lian Chan Chun Sing Lim, Sylvia Chia Shi-Lu Low Thia Khiang Chong, Charles Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap De Souza, Christopher Png Eng Huat Fatimah Lateef Pritam Singh Fong, Arthur Foo Chee Keng, Cedric Foo Mee Har Fu Hai Yien, Grace Gan Kim Yong Gan Thiam Poh Goh Chok Tong Halimah Yacob Heng Chee How Heng Swee Keat Hri Kumar Nair Inderjit Singh Indranee Rajah Intan Azura Mokhtar Iswaran, S. Janil Puthucheary Khaw Boon Wan Khor Lean Suan, Amy Lam Pin Min Lee Bee Wah Lee, Desmond Lee, Ellen Lee Hsien Loong Lee Yi Shyan Lim Biow Chuan Lim Hng Kiang Lim Siang Keat, Raymond Lim Swee Say Lim Wee Kiak

Ayes - continued

Low, Penny Low Yen Ling Lui Tuck Yew Mah Bow Tan Masagos Zulkifli B M M Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim Neo, Lily Ng Eng Hen Ng Phek Hoong, Irene Ong Kim Huat, David Ong Teng Koon Phua Lay Peng, Denise Seah Kian Peng Seng Han Thong Shanmugam, K. Sim Ann Sitoh Yih Pin Tan Chuan-Jin Tan, Jessica Tay Teck Guan, Patrick Teo, Josephine Teo Ser Luck Tharman Shanmugaratnam Tin Pei Ling Tong Chun Fai, Edwin Vikram Nair Vivian Balakrishnan Wong, Lawrence Yam Ziming, Alex Yeo, Alvin Yeo Guat Kwang Zainal Sapari Zaqy Mohamad

Bill accordingly read a third time in accordance with Article 5(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of Singapore.

6 Supreme Court of Judicature (Amendment) Bill – read a second time and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill - (Minister for Law).

#### (In the Committee)

Clauses 1 to 16 inclusive agreed to.

The Schedule agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment; read a third time.

7 Legal Profession (Amendment) Bill – read a second time and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill - (Minister for Law).

(In the Committee)

Clauses 1 to 62 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment; read a third time.

8 Judges' Remuneration (Amendment) Bill – read a second time and committee to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill - (Minister for Law).

(In the Committee)

Clauses 1 to 4 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment; read a third time.

9 Statutes (Miscellaneous Amendments – Deputy Attorney-General) Bill – read a second time and committee to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Minister for Law).

### (In the Committee)

Clauses 1 to 9 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment; read a third time.

- 10 Animals and Birds (Amendment) Bill (Mr Yeo Guat Kwang, Member for Ang Mo Kio) Motion made, "That the Bill be now read a second time.".
- 11 Adjournment of Debate (Government Whip) Motion made, and Question put Resolved, "That the debate be now adjourned.".

Debate to be resumed Tomorrow.

- 12 Adjournment (Government Whip) Motion made, and Question proposed, "That Parliament do now adjourn"; Debate arising.
  - On Question put Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn.".

Adjourned at 7.15 pm

HALIMAH YACOB, Speaker

# MEMORANDUM

Mdm Speaker will take the Chair again at 1.30 pm on Wednesday, 5 November 2014.