# VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE

### **Second Session**

## THURSDAY, 12 FEBRUARY 2015

*No. 23* **1.30 pm** 188

#### PRESENT:

Mdm SPEAKER (Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong)).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for Defence.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms CHIA YONG YONG (Nominated Member).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr THOMAS CHUA KEE SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Assoc Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms KUIK SHIAO-YIN (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Minister of State, Ministry of Health.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Ms LEE LI LIAN (Punggol East).

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development.

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

 $Mr\ RAYMOND\ LIM\ SIANG\ KEAT\ (East\ Coast).$ 

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Social and Family Development and Minister for Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport.

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of National Development.

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Health and Minister for Transport.

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Communications and Information.

Ms RITA SOH SIOW LAN (Nominated Member).

Dr BENEDICT TAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower.

Assoc Prof RANDOLPH TAN (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Prof TAN TAI YONG (Nominated Member).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Communications and Information.

Assoc Prof Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

## ABSENT:

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K KARTHIKEYAN (Nominated Member).

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr MOHD ISMAIL HUSSEIN (Nominated Member).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SITOH YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

- Papers presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
  - 1.1 Advice of the Council of Presidential Advisers on the Appointment of Acting Attorney-General – Presented on 3 February 2015 (S. 13 of 2015).
  - Fourth Report of the Public Accounts Committee Presented on 4 February 2015 (Parl. 2 of 2015).
  - 1.3 Income Tax (Productivity and Innovation Credit Plus Scheme) Regulations 2015
     Presented on 4 February 2015 (S. L. 25 of 2015).
  - 1.4 Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council – Presented on 9 February 2015 (Misc. 1 of 2015).
  - Public Utilities (Water Supply) (Amendment) Regulations 2015 Presented on 9 February 2015 (S. L. 26 of 2015).
  - 1.6 Road Traffic (Electronic Road Pricing System) (Amendment) Rules 2015
     Presented on 10 February 2015 (S. L. 27 of 2015).
  - 1.7 Central Provident Fund (New Minimum Sum Scheme) (Amendment) Regulations 2015 – Presented on 11 February 2015 (S. L. 28 of 2015).
  - 1.8 Central Provident Fund (Revised Minimum Sum Scheme) (Amendment) Regulations 2015 – Presented on 11 February 2015 (S. L. 29 of 2015).
  - Central Provident Fund (Minimum Sum Scheme) (Amendment) Regulations 2015
    Presented on 11 February 2015 (S. L. 30 of 2015).
  - 1.10 Central Provident Fund (Minimum Sum Topping-Up Scheme) (Amendment) Regulations 2015 Presented on 11 February 2015 (S. L. 31 of 2015).
  - 1.11 Central Provident Fund (LifeLong Income Scheme) (Amendment) Regulations 2015
    Presented on 11 February 2015 (S. L. 32 of 2015).
  - 1.12 Central Provident Fund (Amendment) Regulations 2015 Presented on 11 February 2015 (S. L. 33 of 2015).
  - Central Provident Fund (Amendment) Rules 2015 Presented on 11 February 2015 (S. L. 34 of 2015).
  - 1.14 Road Traffic (Motor Vehicles, Wearing of Seat Belts) (Amendment) Rules 2015
     Presented on 12 February 2015 (S. L. 35 of 2015).
  - 1.15 Road Traffic (Amendment) Rules 2015 Presented on 12 February 2015 (S. L. 36 of 2015).
  - 1.16 Road Traffic (Prescribed Offences and Prescribed Notices) (Amendment) Rules 2015 – Presented on 12 February 2015 (S. L. 37 of 2015).

- 1.17 Road Traffic (Composition of Offences) (Amendment) Rules 2015 Presented on 12 February 2015 (S. L. 38 of 2015).
- 1.18 Road Traffic (New Drivers) (Amendment) Rules 2015 Presented on 12 February 2015 (S. L. 39 of 2015).
- 1.19 Road Traffic (Motor Vehicles, Driving Licences) (Amendment) Rules 2015
  Presented on 12 February 2015 (S. L. 40 of 2015).
- 1.20 Remote Gambling (Access and Payment Blocking Orders) Regulations 2015
   Presented on 12 February 2015 (S. L. 41 of 2015).
- Remote Gambling (Composition of Offences) Regulations 2015 Presented on 12 February 2015 (S. L. 42 of 2015).
- 2 22 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 State Lands (Amendment) Bill "to amend the State Lands Act (Chapter 314 of the 1996 Revised Edition) to clarify the ownership of the subsoil below the surface of any land, to make related amendments to the Boundaries and Survey Maps Act (Chapter 25 of the 2006 Revised Edition) and the State Lands Encroachments Act (Chapter 315 of the 1985 Revised Edition), and to make consequential amendments to certain other written laws" presented by the Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law; read the first time; to be read a second time after the conclusion of proceedings on the Estimates of Expenditure for FY2015/16 and to be printed. [Bill No. 6/2015].
- Land Acquisition (Amendment) Bill "to amend the Land Acquisition Act (Chapter 152 of the 1985 Revised Edition) to facilitate compulsory acquisition of stratum of airspace above or subterranean space below the surface of land, and to make related amendments to certain other written laws for that purpose" presented by the Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law; read the first time; to be read a second time after the conclusion of proceedings on the Estimates of Expenditure for FY2015/16 and to be printed. [Bill No. 7/2015].
- 5 Deep Seabed Mining Bill read a second time and committed to a Committee of the whole House.

The House immediately resolved itself into a Committee on the Bill – (Minister for Trade and Industry).

(In the Committee)

Clauses 1 to 25 inclusive agreed to.

Bill to be reported.

Bill reported, without amendment; read a third time.

- Time Limit for Speeches (Leader of the House) (with the consent of Mdm Speaker and the general assent of Members present) Motion made, and Question put Resolved, "That the proceedings on item 2 on the Order Paper for today be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) in respect of the Minister for National Development's speech."
- 7 Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of AHPETC (Minister for National Development) Motion made, and Question proposed – "That this Parliament:
  - (i) notes with concern the Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council (AHPETC) (Paper Misc. 1 of 2015), specifically its findings on:
    - (a) the deficiencies in AHPETC's financial and accounting systems, record-keeping and safeguards;
    - (b) the uncertain accuracy and reliability of AHPETC's accounts;
    - (c) the lack of proper disclosure and oversight by AHPETC's Town Councillors, especially over related-party transactions and conflicts of interest; and
    - (d) the risk that AHPETC has not properly managed and spent public funds;
  - (ii) calls on all Town Councils to uphold high standards of accounting, reporting and corporate governance so as to safeguard residents' interests; and
  - (iii) supports strengthening the legislative framework for Town Councils, in order to hold those responsible for their good management to proper account."; Debate arising.
- Time Limit for Speeches (Ms Sylvia Lim, Member for Aljunied) (with the consent of Mdm Speaker and the general assent of Members present) Motion made, and Question put Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) in respect of my speech."
- 9 Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of AHPETC (Minister for National Development) Debate resumed on Question – "That this Parliament:
  - (i) notes with concern the Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council (AHPETC) (Paper Misc. 1 of 2015), specifically its findings on:
    - (a) the deficiencies in AHPETC's financial and accounting systems, record-keeping and safeguards;
    - (b) the uncertain accuracy and reliability of AHPETC's accounts;
    - (c) the lack of proper disclosure and oversight by AHPETC's Town Councillors, especially over related-party transactions and conflicts of interest; and
    - (d) the risk that AHPETC has not properly managed and spent public funds;
  - (ii) calls on all Town Councils to uphold high standards of accounting, reporting and corporate governance so as to safeguard residents' interests; and
  - (iii) supports strengthening the legislative framework for Town Councils, in order to hold those responsible for their good management to proper account.".

- 10 Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of AHPETC (Minister for National Development) Debate resumed on Question, "That this Parliament:
  - (i) notes with concern the Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council (AHPETC) (Paper Misc. 1 of 2015), specifically its findings on:
    - (a) the deficiencies in AHPETC's financial and accounting systems, record-keeping and safeguards;
    - (b) the uncertain accuracy and reliability of AHPETC's accounts;
    - (c) the lack of proper disclosure and oversight by AHPETC's Town Councillors, especially over related-party transactions and conflicts of interest; and
    - (d) the risk that AHPETC has not properly managed and spent public funds;
  - (ii) calls on all Town Councils to uphold high standards of accounting, reporting and corporate governance so as to safeguard residents' interests; and
  - (iii) supports strengthening the legislative framework for Town Councils, in order to hold those responsible for their good management to proper account.".
- Time Limit for Speeches (Government Whip) (with the consent of Mdm Speaker and the general assent of Members present) Motion made, and Question put Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) in respect of the Minister for Law's speech."
- 12 Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of AHPETC (Minister for National Development) Debate resumed on Question, "That this Parliament:
  - (i) notes with concern the Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council (AHPETC) (Paper Misc. 1 of 2015), specifically its findings on:
    - (a) the deficiencies in AHPETC's financial and accounting systems, record-keeping and safeguards;
    - (b) the uncertain accuracy and reliability of AHPETC's accounts;
    - (c) the lack of proper disclosure and oversight by AHPETC's Town Councillors, especially over related-party transactions and conflicts of interest; and
    - (d) the risk that AHPETC has not properly managed and spent public funds;
  - (ii) calls on all Town Councils to uphold high standards of accounting, reporting and corporate governance so as to safeguard residents' interests; and
  - (iii) supports strengthening the legislative framework for Town Councils, in order to hold those responsible for their good management to proper account.".

13 Adjournment of Debate – (Government Whip) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the debate be now adjourned.".

Debate to be resumed Tomorrow.

14 Adjournment – (Government Whip) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn.".

Adjourned at 6.51 pm

HALIMAH YACOB, Speaker

## MEMORANDUM

Mdm Speaker will take the Chair again at 1.30 pm on Friday, 13 February 2015.