

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

---

**Second Session**

---

MONDAY, 9 MARCH 2015

*No. 30*

**11.30 am**

241

---

---

PRESENT:

Mdm SPEAKER (Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong)).

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for Defence.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms CHIA YONG YONG (Nominated Member).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr THOMAS CHUA KEE SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Assoc Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr K KARTHIKEYAN (Nominated Member).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms KUIK SHIAO-YIN (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Minister of State, Ministry of Health.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Ms LEE LI LIAN (Punggol East).

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport.

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of National Development.

Mr MOHD ISMAIL HUSSEIN (Nominated Member).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Health and Minister for Transport.

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Communications and Information.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms RITA SOH SIOW LAN (Nominated Member).

Dr BENEDICT TAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower.

Assoc Prof RANDOLPH TAN (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Prof TAN TAI YONG (Nominated Member).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Communications and Information.

Assoc Prof Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development.

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Social and Family Development and Minister for Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

---

- 1 Estimates for the financial year 1 April 2015 to 31 March 2016 (Paper Cmd. 1 of 2015) – Committee of Supply (3<sup>rd</sup> Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

*(In the Committee)*

Head V – Ministry of Trade and Industry –

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head V of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Liang Eng Hwa).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$751,955,800 for Head V agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$3,875,084,000 for Head V agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head S – Ministry of Manpower –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head S of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Zainudin Nordin).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$1,454,043,600 for Head S agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$24,289,900 for Head S agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head M – Ministry of Finance –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head M of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Liang Eng Hwa).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$738,386,200 for Head M agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$178,657,400 for Head M agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head Q – Ministry of Communications and Information –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head Q of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Zaqy Mohamad); Debate arising.

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker, Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported now and leave be asked to sit again tomorrow." – (Minister for Communications and Information).

Progress reported – (Minister for Communications and Information).

Committee to sit again Tomorrow.

---

2 Adjourment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn."

Adjourned at 7.40 pm

HALIMAH YACOB,  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Mdm Speaker will take the Chair again at 11.30 am on Tuesday, 10 March 2015.

---