VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE

First Session

FRIDAY, 8 MARCH 2013

No. 47 **12 noon** 333

PRESENT:

Mdm SPEAKER (Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong)).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Acting Minister for Social and Family Development and Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Ms FAIZAH JAMAL (Nominated Member).

Mr NICHOLAS FANG (Nominated Member).

Assoc Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Acting Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms JANICE KOH (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West).

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Ms LEE LI LIAN (Punggol East).

Mr DESMOND LEE TI-SENG (Jurong).

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LAURENCE LIEN (Nominated Member).

Ms MARY LIEW (Nominated Member).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris- Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport.

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Defence and Minister for National Development.

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Health and Minister for Transport.

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr R DHINAKARAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Communications and Information.

Mr SITOH YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Acting Minister for Culture, Community and Youth.

No. 47 8 MARCH 2013 336

Mr TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Acting Minister for Manpower and Senior Minister of State, Ministry of National Development.

Asst Prof TAN KHENG BOON EUGENE (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Ms TAN SU SHAN (Nominated Member).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr TEO SIONG SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Acting Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information.

Assoc Prof Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

No. 47 8 MARCH 2013 337

ABSENT:

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

- Papers presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
 - Fees (Singapore Civil Defence Force) (Amendment) Order 2013 Presented on 8 March 2013 (S. L. 61 of 2013).
 - 1.2 Road Traffic (Motor Vehicles, Registration and Licensing) (Amendment) Rules 2013 – Presented on 8 March 2013 (S. L. 62 of 2013).
- 2 3 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 Supplementary Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1st April 2012 to 31st March 2013 (Paper Cmd. 4 of 2013) Committee of Supply (Allotted Day) Supply considered in the Committee:

(In the Committee)

Supplementary Main Estimates of Expenditure for FY 2012/2013

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Main Estimates.

Head		\$
C	Auditor-General's Office	619,100
G	Presidential Councils	121,600
O	Ministry of Health	104,175,600
P	Ministry of Home Affairs	182,036,200
R	Ministry of Law	44,527,500
S	Ministry of Manpower	125,595,000
X	Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth	374,251,100

Resolved, "That the sum of \$831,326,100 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Main Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1st April 2012 to 31st March 2013, contained in Paper Cmd. 4 of 2013."

Resolution to be reported.

Supplementary Development Estimates of Expenditure for FY 2012/2013

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Development Estimates.

Head \$

W Ministry of Transport

604,841,700

X Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth

228,978,100

Resolved, "That the sum of \$833,819,800 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Development Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1st April 2012 to 31st March 2013, contained in Paper Cmd. 4 of 2013.".

Resolution to be reported.

Resolutions reported and agreed to.

4 Estimates for the financial year 1st April 2013 to 31st March 2014 (Paper Cmd. 3 of 2013) – Committee of Supply (2nd Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

(In the Committee)

Head N - Ministry of Foreign Affairs -

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head N of the Estimates be reduced by 100.". – (Dr Lim Wee Kiak).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$389,459,800 for Head N agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$60,000,000 for Head N agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head R - Ministry of Law -

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head R of the Estimates be reduced by 100.". – (Mr Hri Kumar Nair).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$242,042,400 for Head R agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$565,072,000 for Head R agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head Q - Ministry of Communications and Information -

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head Q of the Estimates be reduced by 100". – (Mr Zaqy Mohamad).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$539,386,700 for Head Q agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$110,139,100 for Head Q agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head T - Ministry of National Development -

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head T of the Estimates be reduced by \$100.". – (Er Dr Lee Bee Wah); Debate arising.

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker, Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the Chairman do leave the Chair.".

Mr Deputy Speaker suspended the proceedings of the Committee and resumed the Chair of the House.

- 5 Exempted Business (Leader of the House) (With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker and general assent of Members present) Motion made, and Question put Resolved, "That the proceedings on the business of Supply be proceeded with beyond 7.30 pm.".
- Estimates for the financial year 1st April 2013 to 31st March 2014 (Paper Cmd. 3 of 2013)
 Committee of Supply (2nd Allotted Day) Consideration in the Committee of Supply resumed.

(In the Committee)

Head T - Ministry of National Development -

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head T of the Estimates be reduced by 100.". – (Er Dr Lee Bee Wah).

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker, Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported now and leave be asked to sit again on Monday, 11 March 2013.". – (Minister for National Development).

Progress reported – (Minister for National Development).

Committee to sit again on Monday, 11 March 2013.

No. 47 8 MARCH 2013 341

7 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn.".

Adjourned at 7.40 pm

 $\begin{array}{c} \text{HALIMAH YACOB,} \\ \textit{Speaker} \end{array}$

MEMORANDUM

Mdm Speaker will take the Chair again at 11.00 am on Monday, 11 March 2013.