

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

---

**First Session**

---

FRIDAY, 8 FEBRUARY 2013

No. 42

**12.30 pm**

296

---

---

PRESENT:

Mdm SPEAKER (Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong)).

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Acting Minister for Social and Family Development and Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Ms FAIZAH JAMAL (Nominated Member).

Mr NICHOLAS FANG (Nominated Member).

Assoc Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Acting Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms JANICE KOH (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West).

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr DESMOND LEE TI-SENG (Jurong).

Ms LEE LI LIAN (Punggol East).

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LAURENCE LIEN (Nominated Member).

Ms MARY LIEW (Nominated Member).

Mr LIM BIEW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris- Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport.

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Defence and Minister for National Development.

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Health and Minister for Transport.

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr R DHINAKARAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Communications and Information and Minister for Education.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Acting Minister for Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Acting Minister for Manpower and Senior Minister of State, Ministry of National Development.

Asst Prof TAN KHENG BOON EUGENE (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr TEO SIONG SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Acting Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information.

Assoc Prof Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEE KUAN YEOW (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Ms TAN SU SHAN (Nominated Member).

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

---

- 1 1 Question for Oral Answer was answered during Question Time.
- 2 A Sustainable Population for a Dynamic Singapore – (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs) – Motion made, and Question proposed (4 February 2013) – "That this House endorses Paper Cmd. 1 of 2013 on 'A Sustainable Population for a Dynamic Singapore' as the population policy roadmap to address Singapore's demographic challenge, and Paper Misc. 1 of 2013 on 'A High Quality Living Environment for all Singaporeans' as the land use plan to support Singapore's future population."

Amendments proposed (5 February 2013):

- (1) in line 3, to leave out "population policy"; and
- (2) at the end, to add "projections; and supports maintaining a strong Singaporean core by encouraging more Singaporeans to get married and have children, supplemented by a calibrated pace of immigration to prevent the citizen population from shrinking; and recognises that the population projections beyond 2020 are for the purpose of land use and infrastructure planning, and not a population target; and calls on the Government to:
  - (a) place priority on resolving current strains on the infrastructure, particularly in transport;
  - (b) plan, invest in, and implement infrastructure development ahead of demand;
  - (c) ensure that the benefits of our population policies, such as better job opportunities and salaries, flow to Singaporeans; and
  - (d) carry out medium term reviews of our population policies and assumptions to take into account the changing needs of Singapore and Singaporeans, as well as changing domestic and external circumstances." – (Mr Liang Eng Hwa).

Question again proposed on resumption of debate, "That the words proposed to be left out, be left out."; Debate resumed.

- 3 Restriction of Speeches – (Government Whip) – (with the consent of Mdm Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That, notwithstanding the Standing Orders, the proceedings on item no. 1 in the Order Paper for today be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(3) in respect of the Deputy Prime Minister speaking more than once."
- 4 A Sustainable Population for a Dynamic Singapore – Motion made, and Question proposed (4 February 2013) – "That this House endorses Paper Cmd. 1 of 2013 on 'A Sustainable Population for a Dynamic Singapore' as the population policy roadmap to address Singapore's demographic challenge, and Paper Misc. 1 of 2013 on 'A High Quality Living Environment for all Singaporeans' as the land use plan to support Singapore's future population." – (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs).

Amendments proposed (5 February 2013):

- (1) in line 3, to leave out "population policy"; and

- (2) at the end, to add “projections; and supports maintaining a strong Singaporean core by encouraging more Singaporeans to get married and have children, supplemented by a calibrated pace of immigration to prevent the citizen population from shrinking; and recognises that the population projections beyond 2020 are for the purpose of land use and infrastructure planning, and not a population target; and calls on the Government to:
- (a) place priority on resolving current strains on the infrastructure, particularly in transport;
  - (b) plan, invest in, and implement infrastructure development ahead of demand;
  - (c) ensure that the benefits of our population policies, such as better job opportunities and salaries, flow to Singaporeans; and
  - (d) carry out medium term reviews of our population policies and assumptions to take into account the changing needs of Singapore and Singaporeans, as well as changing domestic and external circumstances.” – (Mr Liang Eng Hwa).

Debate resumed on Question, "That the words proposed to be left out, be left out."

- 5 Time Limit for Speeches – (Government Whip) – (with the consent of Mdm Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provision of Standing Order No. 48(8) in respect of the Prime Minister’s speech and Deputy Prime Minister’s reply."
- 6 A Sustainable Population for a Dynamic Singapore – Motion made, and Question proposed (4 February 2013) – "That this House endorses Paper Cmd. 1 of 2013 on 'A Sustainable Population for a Dynamic Singapore' as the population policy roadmap to address Singapore’s demographic challenge, and Paper Misc. 1 of 2013 on 'A High Quality Living Environment for all Singaporeans' as the land use plan to support Singapore’s future population." – (Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs).

Amendments proposed (5 February 2013):

- (1) in line 3, to leave out “population policy”; and
- (2) at the end, to add “projections; and supports maintaining a strong Singaporean core by encouraging more Singaporeans to get married and have children, supplemented by a calibrated pace of immigration to prevent the citizen population from shrinking; and recognises that the population projections beyond 2020 are for the purpose of land use and infrastructure planning, and not a population target; and calls on the Government to:
- (a) place priority on resolving current strains on the infrastructure, particularly in transport;
  - (b) plan, invest in, and implement infrastructure development ahead of demand;
  - (c) ensure that the benefits of our population policies, such as better job opportunities and salaries, flow to Singaporeans; and
  - (d) carry out medium term reviews of our population policies and assumptions to take into account the changing needs of Singapore and Singaporeans, as well as changing domestic and external circumstances.” – (Mr Liang Eng Hwa).

Debate resumed on Question, "That the words proposed to be left out, be left out."

Question put and agreed to.

Question, "That the words proposed to be added, be added.", put and agreed to.

On Question put on the Original Motion, as amended, the House divided: Ayes 77, Noes 13, Abstention 1.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>Noes</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Ang Hin Kee	Chen Show Mao	Eugene Tan
Ang Wei Neng	Lina Chiam	
Baey Yam Keng	Faizah Jamal	
Chan Chun Sing	Gerald Giam	
Charles Chong	Janice Koh	
Christopher De Souza	Lee Li Lian	
R Dhinakaran	Laurence Lien	
Nicholas Fang	Sylvia Lim	
Fatimah Lateef	Low Thia Khiong	
Arthur Fong	Muhamad Faisal Manap	
Cedric Foo	Png Eng Huat	
Foo Mee Har	Pritam Singh	
Grace Fu Hai Yien	Yee Jenn Jong	
Gan Kim Yong		
Gan Thiam Poh		
Goh Chok Tong		
Halimah Yacob		
Hawazi Daipi		
Heng Chee How		
Heng Swee Keat		
Hri Kumar Nair		
Intan Azura Mokhtar		
S Iswaran		
Janil Puthuchearry		
Khaw Boon Wan		
Amy Khor		
Lam Pin Min		
Lee Bee Wah		
Desmond Lee		
Ellen Lee		
Lee Hsien Loong		
Lee Yi Shyan		
Liang Eng Hwa		
Mary Liew		
Lim Biow Chuan		
Lim Hng Kiang		
Lim Swee Say		
Lim Wee Kiak		
Penny Low		
Low Yen Ling		
Lui Tuck Yew		
Mah Bow Tan		
Masagos Zulkifli		
Mohamad Maliki Osman		
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim		



*Ayes – continued*

Lily Neo  
Irene Ng Phek Hoong  
David Ong  
Ong Teng Koon  
Denise Phua  
Seah Kian Peng  
Seng Han Thong  
K Shanmugam  
Sim Ann  
Sitoh Yih Pin  
Tan Chuan-Jin  
Jessica Tan Soon Neo  
Sam Tan Chin Siong  
Patrick Tay Teck Guan  
Teo Chee Hean  
Teo Ho Pin  
Josephine Teo  
Teo Ser Luck  
Teo Siong Seng  
Tharman Shanmugaratnam  
Tin Pei Ling  
Edwin Tong  
Vikram Nair  
Vivian Balakrishnan  
Wong Kan Seng  
Lawrence Wong  
Yaacob Ibrahim  
Alex Yam Ziming  
Yeo Guat Kwang  
Zainal Sapari  
Zainudin Nordin  
Zaqy Mohamad

Resolved, "That this House endorses Paper Cmd. 1 of 2013 on 'A Sustainable Population for a Dynamic Singapore' as the roadmap to address Singapore's demographic challenge, and Paper Misc. 1 of 2013 on 'A High Quality Living Environment for all Singaporeans' as the land use plan to support Singapore's future population projections; and supports maintaining a strong Singaporean core by encouraging more Singaporeans to get married and have children, supplemented by a calibrated pace of immigration to prevent the citizen population from shrinking; and recognises that the population projections beyond 2020 are for the purpose of land use and infrastructure planning, and not a population target; and calls on the Government to:

- (a) place priority on resolving current strains on the infrastructure, particularly in transport;
- (b) plan, invest in, and implement infrastructure development ahead of demand;
- (c) ensure that the benefits of our population policies, such as better job opportunities and salaries, flow to Singaporeans; and
- (d) carry out medium term reviews of our population policies and assumptions to take into account the changing needs of Singapore and Singaporeans, as well as changing domestic and external circumstances."

- 7      Adjournment – (Government Whip) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to a date to be fixed."

Adjourned at 6.01 pm

HALIMAH YACOB,  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Parliament stands adjourned to a date to be fixed.

---