

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

---

**Second Session**

---

FRIDAY, 6 MARCH 2015

No. 29

**11.30 am**

233

---

---

PRESENT:

Mdm SPEAKER (Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong)).

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for Defence.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms CHIA YONG YONG (Nominated Member).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr THOMAS CHUA KEE SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Assoc Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr K KARTHIKEYAN (Nominated Member).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms KUIK SHIAO-YIN (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Minister of State, Ministry of Health.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Ms LEE LI LIAN (Punggol East).

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development.

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Social and Family Development and Minister for Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport.

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of National Development.

Mr MOHD ISMAIL HUSSEIN (Nominated Member).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Health and Minister for Transport.

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Communications and Information.

Mr SITOY YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms RITA SOH SIOU LAN (Nominated Member).

Dr BENEDICT TAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Assoc Prof RANDOLPH TAN (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Prof TAN TAI YONG (Nominated Member).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Communications and Information.

Assoc Prof Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

---

- 1 Supplementary Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1 April 2014 to 31 March 2015 (Paper Cmd. 2 of 2015) – Committee of Supply (Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

*(In the Committee)*

Supplementary Main Estimates  
of Expenditure for FY2014/2015

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Main Estimates.

<i>Head</i>	\$
E Judicature	28,244,700
K Ministry of Education	257,000,000
L Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources	33,910,400
P Ministry of Home Affairs	285,000,000
Q Ministry of Communications and Information	29,767,800
S Ministry of Manpower	43,700,000
V Ministry of Trade and Industry	32,640,400
X Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth	51,630,500

Resolved, "That the sum of \$761,893,800 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Main Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1<sup>st</sup> April 2014 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2015, contained in Paper Cmd. 2 of 2015."

Resolution to be reported.

Supplementary Development Estimates  
of Expenditure for FY2014/2015

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Development Estimates.

<i>Head</i>	\$
L Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources	12,798,500
O Ministry of Health	78,399,500
Q Ministry of Communications and Information	77,416,200

Resolved, "That the sum of \$168,614,200 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Development Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1<sup>st</sup> April 2014 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2015, contained in Paper Cmd. 2 of 2015."

Resolution to be reported.

Resolutions reported and agreed to.

- 2 Estimates for the financial year 1 April 2015 to 31 March 2016 (Paper Cmd. 1 of 2015) – Committee of Supply (2<sup>nd</sup> Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

*(In the Committee)*

Head P – Ministry of Home Affairs –

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head P of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Hri Kumar Nair).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$4,416,468,500 for Head P agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$582,336,800 for Head P agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head K – Ministry of Education –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head K of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Lim Biow Chuan).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$11,400,000,000 for Head K agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$700,000,000 for Head K agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head V – Ministry of Trade and Industry –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head V of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Liang Eng Hwa); Debate arising.

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker, Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported now and leave be asked to sit again on Monday, 9 March 2015." – (Minister for Trade and Industry).

Progress reported – (Minister for Trade and Industry).

Committee to sit again on Monday, 9 March 2015.

---

3 Adjournalment – (Government Whip) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn."

Adjourned at 7.50 pm

HALIMAH YACOB,  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Mdm Speaker will take the Chair again at 11.30 am on Monday, 9 March 2015.

---