

# VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE

---

## First Session

---

FRIDAY, 2 MARCH 2012

No. 18

11.00 am

113

---

---

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr MICHAEL PALMER (Punggol East)).

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Acting Minister for Community Development, Youth and Sports and Minister of State, Ministry of Information, Communications and the Arts.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Ms FAIZAH JAMAL (Nominated Member).

Mr NICHOLAS FANG (Nominated Member).

Assoc. Prof. FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Information, Communications and the Arts and Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong), Minister of State, Ministry of Community Development, Youth and Sports.

---

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms JANICE KOH (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West).

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr DESMOND LEE TI-SENG (Jurong).

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LAURENCE LIEN (Nominated Member).

Ms MARY LIEW (Nominated Member).

Mr LIM BIEW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc. Prof. Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon).

---

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr R DHINAKARAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Law.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Acting Minister for Community Development, Youth and Sports.

BG (NS) TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development and Ministry of Manpower.

Asst. Prof. TAN KHENG BOON EUGENE (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Ms TAN SU SHAN (Nominated Member).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister, Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister, Minister for Finance and Minister for Manpower.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Education.

Assoc. Prof. Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Information, Communications and the Arts and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Defence and Minister for National Development.

Mr TEO SIONG SENG (Nominated Member).

---

- 1 1 Question for Oral Answer was answered during Question Time.
- 2 Supplementary Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1<sup>st</sup> April 2011 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2012 (Paper Cmd. 3 of 2012) – Committee of Supply (Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

*(In the Committee)*

Supplementary Main Estimates  
of Expenditure for FY 2011/2012

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Main Estimates.

<i>Head</i>	\$
C Auditor-General's Office	2,463,600
E Judicature	1,583,400
I Ministry of Community Development, Youth and Sports	3,597,300
M Ministry of Finance	9,223,500
Q Ministry of Information, Communications and the Arts	32,469,300
R Ministry of Law	20,663,000
T Ministry of National Development	400,644,983
V Ministry of Trade and Industry	31,202,600

Resolved, "That the sum of \$501,847,683 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Main Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1<sup>st</sup> April 2011 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2012, contained in Paper Cmd. 3 of 2012."

Resolution to be reported.

Supplementary Development Estimates  
of Expenditure for FY 2011/2012

The sums stated for the Heads stated below agreed to stand part of the Supplementary Development Estimates.

<i>Head</i>	\$
I Ministry of Community Development, Youth and Sports	11,924,800
Q Ministry of Information, Communications and the Arts	75,885,000
R Ministry of Law	45,165,600
W Ministry of Transport	376,778,400

Resolved, "That the sum of \$509,753,800 shall be supplied to the Government under the Heads of Expenditure for the public services shown in the Supplementary Development Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 1<sup>st</sup> April 2011 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2012, contained in Paper Cmd. 3 of 2012."

Resolution to be reported.

Resolutions reported and agreed to.

- 3 Estimates for the financial year 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2013 (Paper Cmd. 2 of 2012) – Committee of Supply (2<sup>nd</sup> Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

*(In the Committee)*

Head M – Ministry of Finance –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head M of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Ms Jessica Tan Soon Neo).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$644,607,500 for Head M agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$131,918,000 for Head M agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head V – Ministry of Trade and Industry –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head V of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Ms Jessica Tan Soon Neo).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$871,720,700 for Head V agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$5,491,448,800 for Head V agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

---

---

Head Q – Ministry of Information, Communications and the Arts –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head Q of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Ms Indranee Rajah).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$774,543,300 for Head Q agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$364,234,400 for Head Q agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head T – Ministry of National Development –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head T of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Er Dr Lee Bee Wah); Debate arising.

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker, Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported now and leave be asked to sit again on Monday, 5 March 2012." – (Minister for National Development).

Progress reported – (Minister for National Development).

Committee to sit again on Monday, 5 March 2012.

4 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn."

Adjourned at 7.24 pm

MICHAEL PALMER  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 11.00 am on Monday, 5 March 2012.

---