

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

---

**Second Session**

---

FRIDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2015

No. 24

**1.30 pm**

198

---

---

PRESENT:

Mdm SPEAKER (Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong)).

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Social and Family Development and Second Minister for Defence.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Ms CHIA YONG YONG (Nominated Member).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr THOMAS CHUA KEE SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Assoc Prof FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for the Environment and Water Resources and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Law and Ministry of Education.

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms KUIK SHIAO-YIN (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West), Minister of State, Ministry of Health.

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr DESMOND LEE (Jurong), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development.

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Ms LEE LI LIAN (Punggol East).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Social and Family Development and Minister for Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport.

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of National Development.

Mr MOHD ISMAIL HUSSEIN (Nominated Member).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Health and Minister for Transport.

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PNG ENG HUAT (Hougang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Communications and Information.

Mr SITOH YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms RITA SOH SIOW LAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth.

Mr TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower.

Assoc Prof RANDOLPH TAN (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Communications and Information.

Assoc Prof Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Communications and Information and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr K KARTHIKEYAN (Nominated Member).

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Dr BENEDICT TAN (Nominated Member).

Prof TAN TAI YONG (Nominated Member).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

---

- 
- 1 Papers presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
- 1.1 Advice of the Council of the Presidential Advisers on the Appointment of the Accountant-General – Presented on 13 February 2015 (S. 14 of 2015)
- 1.2 Residential Property (Fees) (Amendment) Rules 2015 – Presented on 13 February 2015 (S. L. 43 of 2015).
- 2 10 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of AHPETC – (Minister for National Development) – Question again proposed on the resumption of Debate, "That this Parliament:
- (i) notes with concern the Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council (AHPETC) (Paper Misc. 1 of 2015), specifically its findings on:
- (a) the deficiencies in AHPETC's financial and accounting systems, record-keeping and safeguards;
  - (b) the uncertain accuracy and reliability of AHPETC's accounts;
  - (c) the lack of proper disclosure and oversight by AHPETC's Town Councillors, especially over related-party transactions and conflicts of interest; and
  - (d) the risk that AHPETC has not properly managed and spent public funds;
- (ii) calls on all Town Councils to uphold high standards of accounting, reporting and corporate governance so as to safeguard residents' interests; and
- (iii) supports strengthening the legislative framework for Town Councils, in order to hold those responsible for their good management to proper account."; Debate arising.
- 4 Time Limit for Speeches – (Leader of the House) – (with the consent of Mdm Speaker and the general assent of Members present) – Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That the proceedings on the item under discussion be exempted from the provisions of Standing Order No. 48(8) in respect of the Minister for Education's speech."
- 5 Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of AHPETC – (Minister for National Development) – Debate resumed on Question, "That this Parliament:
- (i) notes with concern the Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council (AHPETC) (Paper Misc. 1 of 2015), specifically its findings on:
- (a) the deficiencies in AHPETC's financial and accounting systems, record-keeping and safeguards;
  - (b) the uncertain accuracy and reliability of AHPETC's accounts;

- (c) the lack of proper disclosure and oversight by AHPETC's Town Councillors, especially over related-party transactions and conflicts of interest; and
- (d) the risk that AHPETC has not properly managed and spent public funds;
- (ii) calls on all Town Councils to uphold high standards of accounting, reporting and corporate governance so as to safeguard residents' interests; and
- (iii) supports strengthening the legislative framework for Town Councils, in order to hold those responsible for their good management to proper account."

On Question put – a division was taken: Ayes 85, No Nil, Abstention Nil.

<i>Ayes</i>	<i>No</i>	<i>Abstention</i>
Ang Hin Kee	Nil	Nil
Ang Wei Neng		
Baey Yam Keng		
Chan Chun Sing		
Chen Show Mao		
Chia Shi-Lu		
Chia Yong Yong		
Chiam Lina		
Chua Thomas		
De Souza Christopher		
Fatimah Lateef		
Fong, Arthur		
Foo Mee Har		
Fu Hai Yien, Grace		
Gan Kim Yong		
Gan Thiam Poh		
Giam Gerald		
Goh Chok Tong		
Halimah Yacob		
Hawazi Daipi		
Heng Chee How		
Heng Swee Keat		
Hri Kumar Nair		
Inderjit Singh		
Indranee Rajah		
Intan Azura Mokhtar		
Iswaran, S.		
Janil Puthuchery		
Khaw Boon Wan		
Khor Lean Suan, Amy		
Kuik Shiao-Yin		
Lam Pin Min		
Lee Bee Wah		
Lee, Desmond		
Lee, Ellen		
Lee Hsien Loong		

*Ayes - continued*

Lee Li Lian  
Lee Yi Shyan  
Liang Eng Hwa  
Lim Biow Chuan  
Lim Hng Kiang  
Lim Swee Say  
Lim, Sylvia  
Lim Wee Kiak  
Low, Penny  
Low Thia Khiang  
Low Yen Ling  
Masagos Zulkifli B M M  
Mohamad Maliki Osman  
Muhamad Faisal Abdul Manap  
Muhammad Faishal Ibrahim  
Neo, Lily  
Ng Eng Hen  
Ng Phek Hoong, Irene  
Ong Kim Huat, David  
Ong Teng Koon  
Phua Lay Peng, Denise  
Png Eng Huat  
Pritam Singh  
Seng Han Thong  
Shanmugam, K.  
Sim Ann  
Sitoh Yih Pin  
Soh Siow Lan, Rita  
Tan Chuan-Jin  
Tan Soon Neo, Jessica  
Tan Chin Siong, Sam  
Tay Teck Guan, Patrick  
Teo Chee Hean  
Teo Ho Pin  
Teo, Josephine  
Teo Ser Luck  
Tharman Shanmugaratnam  
Tin Pei Ling  
Tong Chun Fai, Edwin  
Vivian Balakrishnan  
Wong Kan Seng  
Wong, Lawrence  
Yaacob Ibrahim  
Yam Ziming, Alex  
Yee Jenn Jong  
Yeo Guat Kwang  
Zainal Sapari  
Zainudin Nordin  
Zaqy Mohamad



---

Resolved, "That this Parliament:

(i) notes with concern the Auditor-General's Report on the Audit of Aljunied-Hougang-Punggol East Town Council (AHPETC) (Paper Misc. 1 of 2015), specifically its findings on:

- (a) the deficiencies in AHPETC's financial and accounting systems, record-keeping and safeguards;
- (b) the uncertain accuracy and reliability of AHPETC's accounts;
- (c) the lack of proper disclosure and oversight by AHPETC's Town Councillors, especially over related-party transactions and conflicts of interest; and
- (d) the risk that AHPETC has not properly managed and spent public funds;

(ii) calls on all Town Councils to uphold high standards of accounting, reporting and corporate governance so as to safeguard residents' interests; and

(iii) supports strengthening the legislative framework for Town Councils, in order to hold those responsible for their good management to proper account."

6 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to Monday, 23 February 2015."

Adjourned at 5.40 pm

HALIMAH YACOB,  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Mdm Speaker will take the Chair again at 1.30 pm on Monday, 23 February 2015.

---