

**FOURTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE
(SECOND SESSION)**

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS
MONDAY, 4 MARCH 2024**

No. 129

10.30 am

1

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Seah Kian Peng (Marine Parade)).
Mr ANG WEI NENG (West Coast).
Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.
Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Education.
Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (East Coast).
Ms USHA CHANDRADAS (Nominated Member).
Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Transport and Second Minister for Finance.
Mr EDWARD CHIA BING HUI (Holland-Bukit Timah).
Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).
Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).
Mr ERIC CHUA (Tanjong Pagar) Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Social and Family Development.
Mr KEITH CHUA (Nominated Member).
Mr CHUA KHENG WEE LOUIS (Sengkang).
Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).
Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah), Deputy Speaker.
Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).
Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Sustainability and the Environment and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.
Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Trade and Industry.
Ms GAN SIOW HUANG (Marymount), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.
Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).
Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Aljunied).
Mr DERRICK GOH (Nee Soon).
Ms HE TING RU (Sengkang).
Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.
Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (East Coast), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for Economic Policies.
Mr SHAWN HUANG WEI ZHONG (Jurong).
Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Health and Government Whip.
Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.
Dr KOH POH KOON (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Manpower and Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment.
Mr DESMOND LEE (West Coast), Minister for National Development and Minister-in-charge of Social Services Integration.
Mr MARK LEE (Nominated Member).
Mr LEONG MUN WAI (Non-Constituency Member).
Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Bukit Panjang).
Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).
Assoc Prof JAMUS JEROME LIM (Sengkang).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).
Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).
Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.
Ms MARIAM JAAFAR (Sembawang).
Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for Social and Family Development, Second Minister for Health and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.
Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Education and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.
Mr MOHD FAHMI BIN ALIMAN (Marine Parade).
Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).
Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.
Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).
Ms NADIA AHMAD SAMDIN (Ang Mo Kio).
Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).
Ms NG LING LING (Ang Mo Kio).
Miss RACHEL ONG (West Coast).
Mr ONG HUA HAN (Nominated Member).
Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Health.
Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).
Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).
Ms HAZEL POA (Non-Constituency Member).
Ms POH LI SAN (Sembawang).
Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied), Leader of the Opposition.
Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Law.
Assoc Prof RAZWANA BEGUM ABDUL RAHIM (Nominated Member).
Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).
Ms SEE JINLI JEAN (Nominated Member).
Mr SHARAEL TAHA (Pasir Ris-Punggol).
Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of National Development and Deputy Government Whip.
Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).
Ms HANY SOH (Marsiling-Yew Tee).
Ms SUN XUELING (Punggol West), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Social and Family Development.
Dr SYED HARUN ALHABSYI (Nominated Member).
Mr ALVIN TAN (Tanjong Pagar), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.
Ms CARRIE TAN (Nee Soon).
Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Hougang).
Mr DESMOND TAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office.
Mr TAN KIAT HOW (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of National Development.
Dr TAN SEE LENG (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.
Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast), Deputy Speaker.
Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong).
Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Pioneer).
Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.
Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Jalan Besar), Minister for Communications and Information and Second Minister for Home Affairs.
Mr RAJ JOSHUA THOMAS (Nominated Member).
Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Law.

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr WAN RIZAL (Jalan Besar).

Mr DON WEE (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Mr XIE YAO QUAN (Jurong).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms YEO WAN LING (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr YIP HON WENG (Yio Chu Kang).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Radin Mas).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr ZHULKARNAIN ABDUL RAHIM (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance, Second Minister for National Development and Leader of the House.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Kebun Baru).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Mr NEIL PAREKH NIMIL RAJNIKANT (Nominated Member).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

- 1 6 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 2 Estimates for the financial year 1 April 2024 to 31 March 2025 (Paper Cmd. 27 of 2024) – Committee of Supply (4th Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

(In the Committee)

Head K – Ministry of Education –

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head K of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Patrick Tay Teck Guan).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$14,327,475,900 for Head K agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$620,000,000 for Head K agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head S – Ministry of Manpower –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head S of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Desmond Choo).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$3,056,864,300 for Head S agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$131,871,700 for Head S agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head L – Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head L of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Louis Ng Kok Kwang); Debate arising.

- 3 Extension of Sitting – Pursuant to Standing Order No 91(3)(d), Mr Speaker extended the sitting beyond the time specified for the Committee of Supply for a period of up to 30 minutes.
- 4 Estimates for the financial year 1 April 2024 to 31 March 2025 (Paper Cmd. 27 of 2024) – Consideration in the Committee of Supply resumed.

Head L – Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment –

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head L of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Louis Ng Kok Kwang).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$2,834,278,600 for Head L agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$592,239,100 for Head L agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

With the consent of Mr Speaker, Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported and leave be asked to sit again tomorrow." – (Deputy Leader of the House).

Progress reported – (Deputy Leader of the House).

Committee to sit again Tomorrow.

5 Adjournment – (Deputy Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn."

Adjourned at 8.21 pm

SEAH KIAN PENG,
Speaker

MEMORANDUM

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 10.30 am on Tuesday, 5 March 2024.
